

**Sample abstract analysis N (incorrect data classification): Rating N or E (Cook), R-RN: re:look climate;**

| Author(s)      | Reference                                  | Cook category<br>(abstract +<br>title based)<br>E – N – R/U | re:look main<br>category<br>(data based)<br>NR - R | re:look sub<br>category (data<br>based), if R<br>RS – RN - RR | re:look<br>reassessment<br>(this paper) | Details of assessment<br>Comments / Open items |
|----------------|--|---|--|---|---|--|
| Vinther et al. | Nature. 2009, <b>461</b><br>(7262) 385-388 | <b>N<br/>or E?</b>  | <b>R</b>   | <b>RN</b>   | -                                       | Greenland Ice sheet holocene                   |

Title: **Holocene thinning of the Greenland ice** sheet.

Abstract:

On entering an era of global warming, the stability of the Greenland ice sheet (GIS) is an important concern, especially in the light of new evidence of rapidly changing flow and melt conditions at the GIS margins. Studying the response of the GIS to past climatic change may help to advance our understanding of GIS dynamics. The previous interpretation of evidence from stable isotopes ( $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ ) in water from GIS ice cores was that Holocene climate variability on the GIS differed spatially and that a consistent Holocene climate optimum—the unusually warm period from about 9,000 to 6,000 years ago found in many northern-latitude palaeoclimate records—did not exist. Here we extract both the Greenland Holocene temperature history and the evolution of GIS surface elevation at four GIS locations. We achieve this by comparing  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  from GIS ice cores with  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  from ice cores from small marginal icecaps. Contrary to the earlier interpretation of  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  evidence from ice cores, our new temperature history reveals a pronounced Holocene climatic optimum in Greenland coinciding with maximum thinning near the GIS margins. Our  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ -based results are corroborated by the air content of ice cores, a proxy for surface elevation. State-of-the-art ice sheet models are generally found to be underestimating the extent and changes in GIS elevation and area; our findings may help to improve the ability of models to reproduce the GIS response to Holocene climate.

**Justification of Classification:**

**Cook: N (or E?):** The abstract mentions the ‘era of global warming’ without explicitly or implicitly stating that the main factors are man-made. We would consider the Cook et al. assessment to be either N or E, but certainly not R/U.

**re:look climate: R (relevant) RN** The letter details behavior of Greenland ice sheet in the holocene highlighting stronger reaction of the ice to climate changes in the holocene with potential impact on today: While as a political message supporting climate change action the data are relevant, but neutral concerning the question of GHG-AGW.

**Overall re:look conclusion:** Another example of how difficult and misleading a conclusion from political verbiage in the abstract (or the text) is concerning the contribution of the actual data.