Appendix

Olli Poropudas

Explaining the national differences in the level of scientific research – a review of literature

Selected literature

General explanations

Adams, Jonathan. 1998. Benchmarking international research. Nature. Vol. 396, 17 December, 615-618.

Aghion, Philippe, Dewatripont, Mathias, Hoxby, Caroline, Mas-Colell, Andreu & Saper, Andre 2007. Why reform Europe's universities? Bruegel Policy Brief 4/2007. 101–113.

Ben-David, Joseph. 1960. Scientific Productivity and Academic Organization in Nineteenth Century Medicine. American Sociological Review, Vol. 25, No 6 (Dec., 1960), 828–843.

Bland, Carole J., & Ruffin, Mack T. 1992. Characteristics of a Productive Research Environment: Literature Review. Acad, Med. 67 (1992), Number 6, 385–397.

DFA. 2016a. Links between research policy and national academic performance. A comparative study of Denmark, Sweden and the Netherlands. Main Report. Commissioned by the Danish Council for Research and Innovation-policy (DFiR) and carried out a consortium consisting of CFA, Technopolis Group and NIFU.

DFA. 2016b. Links between research policy and national academic performance. A comparative study of Denmark, Sweden and the Netherlands. Background Report. Commissioned by the Danish Council for Research and Innovation-policy (DFiR) and carried out a consortium consisting of CFA, Technopolis Group and NIFU.

DFIR 2014. Viden i spil. Danmark Forsknings- og Innovationspolitiske Råds årsrapport 2014.

Hollingsworth, J. Rogers & Gear, David M. 2012. The Rise and Decline of Hegemonic Systems of Scientific Creativity. Social Science Research Network. Posted June 10, 2012.

Horta, Hugo. 2009. Global and national prominent universities: internationalization, competitiveness and the role of the state. High. Educ. (2009) 58: 387–405.

Karlsson, Staffan & Persson, Olle. 2014. The production of highly cited papers. Tables and graphs from the report "The Swedish production of highly cited papers" complemented with statistics for Norway. In: Benner, Mats & Öquist, Gunnar. 2014. Room for increased ambitions? Governing breakthrough research in Norway 1990–2013. Report to the Research Council of Norway.

Öquist, Gunnar & Brenner, Mats. Fostering breakthrough research: A comparative study. Akademirapport. Kung. Vetenskapsakademien. December 2012.

Öquist, Gunnar & Benner, Mats. 2015. Why Are Some Nations More Successful Than Others in Research Impact? A Comparison Between Denmark and Sweden. In: Incentives and Performance. Governance of Research Organizations. Ed. by Welpe, Isabell M., Wollershem, Jutta, Ringelhan, Stefanie & Osterloh, Margit. Springer 2015, 241–257.

Excellent researchers

Abramo, Giovanni, Cicero, Tindaro & D'Angelo Ciriaco Andrea. 2013. The impact of unproductive and top researchers on overall university research performance. Journal of Informetrcis 7 (2013), 166–175.

Abramo, Giovanni, D'Angelo, Ciriaco Andrea & Soldatenkova, Anastasia. 2016. The ratio of top scientists to the academic staff as an indicator of the competitive strength of universities. Journal of Informetrics. 10 (2016), 596–605.

Allison, Paul D. 1980. Inequality and Scientific Productivity. Social Studies of Science, Vol. 10, No. 2 (May, 1980), 163–179.

Azolay, Pierre, Zivin, Joshua S. Graff & Wang, Jialan. 2010. Superstar Extinction. The Quarterly Journal of Economics, May 2010. 549–589

Basu, Aparna. 2006.Using ISI's 'Highly Cited Researchers' to obtain a country level indicators of citation excellence. Scientometrics, Vol. 68, No. 3 (2006), 361–375.

Batty, Michael. 2003. Citation Geography: It's About Location. The Scientist, Volume 17, Issue 18, 10, Aug. 25, 2003.

Bornman, Lutz & Bauer, Johann. 2015. Which of the world's institutions employ the most highly cited researchers? An analysis of the data from highlycited.com. Journal of the Association for Information Science and Technology. Vol. 66, Issue 10, 2146–2148.

Cole, Jonathan. 1970. Patterns of Intellectual Influence in Scientific Research. Sociology of Education, 1970, Vol. 43 (Fall), 377–403.

Cole, Stephen & Cole, Jonathan R. 1967. Scientific Output and Recognition: A Study in the Operation of the Reward System in Science. American Sociological Review, Volume 32, Issue 3 (Jun., 1967), 377–390.

Feist, Gregory J. 1997. Quantity, Quality, and Depth of Research as Influences on Scientific Eminence: Is Quantity Most Important? Creativity Research Journal 199, Vol. 10, No. 4, 325–335.

Gazni, Ali & Ghaseminik, Zahra. 2015. Author practices in citing other authors, institutions, and journals. Journal of the Association for International Science and Technology, Volume 67, Issue 10, pp. 2536–2549.

Hicks, Diana. 2011. Equity and Excellence in Research Funding. Minerva, 49 (2), 137–151.

Lotka, Alfred J. 1926. The frequency distribution of scientific productivity. Journal of the Washington Academy of Sciences. Vol. 16, No. 12, 317–323.

Price, Derek J. De Solla. 1986. Little Science, Big Science... and Beyond. Columbia University Press.

Recruitment, endogamy

Abramo, Giovanni, D'Angelo, Ciriaco Andrea & Rosati, Francesco. 2014c. Career advancement and scientific performance in universities. Scientometrics (2014) 98, 891–907.

Abramo, Giovanni, D'Angelo, Ciriaco Andrea, Rosati, Francesco. 2015. The determinants of academic career advancement: Evidence from Italy. Science and Public Policy, 42 (6), 761–774.

Allison, Paul D. & Long, J. Scott. 1990. Departmental Effects on Scientific Productivity. American Sociological Review, Vol. 55, NO. 4 (Aug. 1990), 469–478.

Aydogan, Ismail. 2012. The Existence of favoritism in organizations. African Journal of Business Management, Vol. 6 (12), 4577–4586.

Bland, Carole J., Center, Bruce A., Risbey, Kelly J. & Staples, Justin. 2006. The Impact of Appointment Type on the Productivity and Commitment of Full-Time Faculty in Research and Doctoral Institutions. The Journal of Higher Education, Vol. 77, No. 1 (January/February 2006), 89–123.

Blau, Peter M. 1973. The Organization of Academic Work. John Wiley & Sons.

Bonaccorsi, Andrea & Cicero, Tindaro. 2016. Distributed or Concentrated Research Excellence? Evidence From a Large-Scale Research Assessment Exercise. Journal of the Association for Information Science and Technology, 67(12), 2976–2992.

Cole, Stephen. 1992. Making Science. Between Nature and Society. Harvard University Press.

Deloitte. 2014. Researcher's Report 2014. Final Report. European Commission. DG Research and Innovation.

Eisenberg, Theodore & Wells, Martin T. 2000. Inbreeding in Law Scholl Hiring: Assessing the Performance of Faculty Hired from Within. Journal of Legal Studies, vol. XXIX (January 2000), 369–388.

Hargens, Lowell L. & Farr, Grant M. 1973. An Examination of Recent Hypotheses About Institutional Inbreeding. American Journal of Sociology, Vol. 78, No.6 (May, 1973), 1381–1402.

Horta, Hugo. 2013. Understanding the pros and cons of academic inbreeding. University World News. 11. October 2013 Issue No: 291.

Horta, Hugo. 2014. Open, merit-based and transparent recruitment. Final paper for the 2014 ERAC mutual learning workshop on Human Resources and Mobility. Brussels, March 26, 2014.

Horta, Hugo, Veloso, Francisco M., Grediaga, Rocio. 2010. Navel Gazing: Academic Inbreeding and Scientific productivity. Management Science, Vol. 56, No. 3, March 2010, 414–429.

Höhle, Ester Ava. 2017. Early Career Researchers and their Intention to leave Academia in Differing Employment Regimes across Europe. CHER 30th Annual Conference.

Janger, Jurgen & Nowotny, Klaus. 2013. Career choices in academia. WWWforEurope Working Paper, No. 36.

Janger, Jurgen, Strauss, Anna & Campbell, David F.J. 2013. Academic careers: a cross-country perspective. WWWforEurope, Working Paper 37.

Marimon, Ramon, Lietaert, Matthieu & Grigolo, Michele. 2009. Towards the 'Fifth Freedom': Increasing the Mobility of Researchers in the European Union. Higher Education in Europe, Vol. 34, No. 1, April 2009, 25–37.

Martin, Brian. 2009. Academic patronage. The International Journal for Education Integrity, Vol. 5, No. 1, June 2009, 3–19.

Metcalf, Hilary, Rolfe, Heather, Stevens, Philip & Weale, Martin. 2005. Recruitment and Retention of Academic Staff in Higher Education. National Institute of Economic and Social Research. Research Report No 658.

Niland, John. 2007. The Challenges of Building World-Class Universities. In: The World-Class University and Ranking: Aiming Beyond Status. Ed. by Sadlak, Jan & Nian Cai, Liu. Unesco-Cepes, 61–72.

Olsen, Terje Bruen, Kyvik, Svein & Hovdhaugen, Elisabeth. 2005. The promotion to full professor – through competition or by individual competence? Tertiary Education and Management (2005) 11, 299–316.

Salmi, Jamil. 2009. The Challenge of Establishing World-Class Universities. The World Bank, Washington D.C.

Technopolis. 2014. IA study on the Open, transparent, and merit-based recruitment of researchers.

Wyer, Jean C. & Conrad, Clifton F. 1984. Institutional Inbreeding Reexamined. American Educational Research Journal. Spring 1984, Vol. 1, 213–225.

Yang, Bo, Rousseau, Ronald, Haung, Shuiqing & Yan, Sulan. 2015. Do first rate scientists work at first rate organizations? Malaysian Journal of Library & Information Science, Vol. 20, no. 1, 2015, 47–60.

Zinovyeva, Natalia & Bagues, Manuel F. 2012. The role of connections in academic promotions. Discussion Paper series, Forschungsinstitut zur Zukunft der Arbeit, No. 6821

Research time

Bentley, Peter James & Kyvik, Svein. 2013. Individual Differences in Faculty Research Time Allocation Across 13 Countries. Research in Higher Education, May 2013, Volume 54, Issue 3, 329–348.

Crespi, Gustavo A. & Geuna, Aldo. 2004. The Productivity of Science. Report prepared for the Office of Science and Technology, Department of Trade and Industry, SPRU – University of Sussex. July 2004.

Fairweather, James S. 2002. The Mythologies of Faculty Productivity. The Journal of Higher Education, Vol. 73, No. 1 (January/February 2002), 26–48.

Fox, Mary Fran 1992. Research, Teaching, and Publication Productivity: Mutuality Versus Competition in Academia Author(s). Sociology of Education, Vol. 65, No. 4 (Oct., 1992), 293–305.

Gottlieb, Esther E. & Keith, Bruce. 1997. The academic research-teaching nexus in eight advanced-industrialized countries. Higher Education 34, 397–420.

Hattie, John & Marsh, H. W. 1996. The Relationship Between Research and Teaching: A Meta-Analysis. Review of Educational Research; Winter 1996, Vol. 66, No. 4, 507–542.

Kyvik, Sven & Smeby, Jens-Christian. 1994. Teaching and research. The relationship between the supervision of graduate students and faculty research performance. Higher Education 28: 227–239.

Olson, E. Jeffrey. 1994. Institutional and technical constraints on faculty gross productivity in American doctoral universities. Research in Higher Education, Vol. 35, No. 5, 1994, 549–567.

Simon, Rita James. 1974. The Work Habits of Eminent Scholars. Sociology of Work and Occupations, Vol. 1 No. 3, August 1974, 327-33.

White, Charles S., James, Karen, Burke, Lisa A. & Allen, Richard S. 2012. What makes a "research star"? Factors influencing the research productivity of business faculty, International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management, Vol. 61, Iss 6, 584–602.

Autonomy, management

Hemlin, Sven, Allwood, Carl Martin & Martin, Ben. 2008. Creative Knowledge Environments. Creativity Research Journal, 20(2), 196–210.

Hollingsworth, J. Rogers. 2008. Scientific Discoveries: An Institutionalist and Path-Dependent Perspective. Biomedical and health research commission of the European communities.

Competition

Aagard, Kaare & Schneider, Jesper W. 2016. Research funding and national academic performance: Examination of a Danish success story. Science and Public Policy, 43(4), 2016, 518–531.

Abramo, Giovanni, Cicero, Tindaro, & D'Angelo, Ciriaco Andrea. 2012. The dispersion of research performance within and between universities as potential indicators of the competitive intensity in higher education systems. Journal of Informetrics 6 (2012), 155–168.

Abramo, Giovanni & D'Angelo, Ciriaco Andrea & Di Costa, Flavia. 2014. Variability of research performance across disciplines within universities in non-competitive higher education systems. Scientometrics, February 2014, Volume 98, Issue 2, 777–795.

Auranen, Otto ja Nieminen, Mika. 2010. University research funding and publication performance – An international comparison. Research Policy 39 (2010), 822–834.

Ben-David, Joseph. 1960. Scientific Productivity and Academic Organization in Nineteenth Century Medicine. American Sociological Review, Vol. 25, No 6 (Dec., 1960), 828–843.

Besselaar van, Peter, Heyman, Ulf & Sandström, Ulf. 2017. Perverse effects of output-based research funding? Butler's Australian case revisited. Journal of Informetrics 11 (2017), 905–918.

Geuna, Aldo. 2001. The Changing Rationale for European University Research Funding: Are There Negative Unintended Consequence? Journal of Economic Issues. Vol. XXXV No. 3 September 2001, 607–632.

Geuna, Aldo, Martin, Ben R. 2003. University Research Evaluation and Funding: An International Comparison. Minerva 41, 277–304.

Heinze, Thomas, Shapira, Philip, Rogers, Juan D. & Senker, Jacqueline M. 2009. Organizational and institutional influences on creativity in scientific research. Research Policy 38 (2009), 610–623.

Jonkers, Koen & Zacharewicz, Thomas. 2016. Research Based Funding Systems: a Comparative Assessment. JRC Science for Policy Report. European Union.

Kyvik, Svein. 2013. The academic researcher role: enhancing expectations and improved performance. Higher Education (2013), 65:525-538.

Kyvik, Stein. 2007. Changes in Funding University Research: Consequences for Problem Choice and Research Output of Academic Staff. In: Public-Private Dynamics in Higher Education. Expectations, Developments and Outcomes. Ed. by Enders, Jurgen & Jonbloed, Ben. Bielefield, 387–409.

Liefner, Ingo. 2003. Funding, resource allocation, and performance in higher education systems. Higher Education 46: 469–489, 2003.

Marginson, Simon. 2006. Dynamics of national and global competition in higher education. Higher Education (2006) 52: 1–19.

Sandström, Ulf, Heyman, Ulf & van Besselaar, Peter. 2014. The Complex Relationship between Competitive Funding and Performance. In: Proceedings of the science and technology indicators conference 2014 Leiden. Universiteit Leiden – CWTS, 523–533.

Schmidt, Evanthia Kalpazidou. 2012. University Funding Reforms in the Nordic Countries. The Journal of Finance and Management in Colleges and Universities 3: 8, 113–136.

Ylijoki, Oili-Helena, Lyytinen, Anu & Marttila, Liisa. 2011. Different research market: a disciplinary perspective. High. Educ. (2011) 62, 721–740,

Economies of scale, concentration

Abramo, Giovanni, Cicero, Tindaro & D'Angelo Ciriaco Andrea. 2012. Revisiting size effect in higher education research productivity. High. Educ. (2012) 63, 701–717.

Blackburn, Robert, Behymer, Charles E. & Hall, David. 1978. Research Note: Correlates of Faculty Publications. Sociology of Education 1978, Vol. 51 (April), 132–141.

Bloch, Carter, Schneider, Jesper W. & Sinkjaer, Thomas. 2016. Size, Accumulation and Performance for Research Grants: Examining the Role of Size for Centres of Excellence. PLoS ONE 11(2): e0147726.

Bonaccorsi, Andrea & Cinzia, Daraio. 2005. Exploring size and agglomeration effects on public research productivity. Scientometrics, Vol. 63, No 1 (2005), 87-120.

Bonaccorsi, Andrea, Daraio, Cinzia & Simar, Leopold. 2007. Efficiency and productivity in European universities: exploring trade-offs in the strategic profile. In: Universities and Strategic Knowledge Creation. Spezialization ansd Performance in Europe. Ed. by Bonaccorsi, Andrea & Daraio, Cinzia. Edward Elgar, 144–193.

Dubois, Pierre, Rochet, Jean-Pierre & Schlenker, Jean-Marc. 2014. Productivity and Mobility in Academic Research: Evidence from Mathematics. Scientometrics, March 2014, Volume 98, Issue 3, 1669–1701.

Ebadi, Ashkan & Schiffauerova, Andrea. 2016. How to boost scientific production? A statistical analysis of research funding and other influencing factors. Scientometrics. Published online: 04 January 2016.

Fortin, Jean-Michael & Currie, David J. 2013. Big Science vs. Little Science: How Scientific Impact Scales with Funding. PLoS ONE 8(6):e65263.

Hollingsworth, J. Rogers. 2008. Scientific Discoveries: An Institutionalist and Path-Dependent Perspective. Biomedical and health research commission of the European communities.

Jordan, John M., Meador, Mark & Walters, Stephen J.K. 1989. Academic Research Productivity, Department Size and Organization: Further Results. Economics of Education Review, Vol. 8, No. 4, 345–352

Kyvik, Svein. 1995. Department size and resources for administration. Tertiary Education and Management, 1:1, 107–108.

Kyvik, Svein. 1995 (b). Are big universities better than smaller ones? Higher Education 1995, Volume 30, Issue 3, 295–304.

Langfeldt, Liv, Benner, Mats, Sivertsen, Gunnar, Kristiansen, Ernst H., Aksnes, Dag W., Brostad, Siri Borlaug, Hansen, Foss Hanne, Kallerud, Egil & Pelkonen, Antti. 2015. Excellence and growth dynamics: A comparative study of the Matthew effect. Science and Public Policy 42 (2015), 661–675.

Seglen, Per O. & Aksnes, Dag W. 2000. Scientific productivity and group size: A bibliometric analysis of Norwegian microbiological research. Scientometrics, Vol. 49, No. 1 (2000), 125–143.

Tunzelmann von, Nick, Ranga, Marina, Martin, Ben & Geuna, Aldo. 2003. The Effects of Size on Research Performance: A SPRU Review. SPRU. University of Sussex at Brighton.

International collaboration

Abramo, Giovanni, D'Angelo, Ciriaco & Solazzi, Marco. 2011. The relationship between scientists' research performance and the degree of internationalization of their research. Scientometrics (2011) 86, 629–643

Adams, Jonathan. 2013. The fourth age of research. Nature, Volume 497, 2013, 557–560.

Bornmann, Lutz. 2017. Is collaboration among scientists related to the citation impact of papers because their quality increases with collaboration? An analysis based on data from F1000Prime and normalized citation scores. Journal of the Association for Information Science and Technology. Volume 68, Issue 4, April 2017, 1036–1047.

Fanelli, Daniele & Lariviere, Vincent. 2015. Are scientists really publishing more? ISSI 2015, 652-653.

Fanelli, Daniele & Lariviere, Vincent. 2016. Researchers' Individual Publication Rate Has Not Increased in a Century. PLOS ONE 11(3).

Franzoni, Chiara, Scellato, Giuseppe & Stephan, Paula, 2012. The Mover's Advantage: Scientific Performance of Mobile Academics. NBER Working Paper No. 18577. November 2012.

Franzoni, Chiara, Scellato, Giuseppe & Stephan, Paula. 2012. Foreign-born scientists: mobility patterns for 16 countries. Nature Biotechnology, Volume 30 Number 12 December 2012.

Franzoni, Chiara, Scellato, Giuseppe & Stephan, Paula. 2015. International Mobility of Research Scientists: Lessons from GlobSci. In: Global Mobility of Research Scientists. The Economics of Who GOES WHERE and Why. Ed. by Geuna, Aldo. Academic Press.

Luukkonen, Terttu, Persson, Olle & Sivertsen, Gunnar. 1992. Understanding Patterns of International Scientific Collaboration. Science, Technology, & Human Values. Vol. 17 No. 1, Winter 1992, 101–126.

Mamisheishvili, Ketevan & Rosser, Vicki J. 2009. International and Citizen Faculty in the United States: An Examination of their Productivity at Research Universities. Res. High. Educ. (2010) 51, 88–107.

Moed, Hank, Aisali, M'hamed & Plume, Andrew. 2012. Studying scientific migration in Scopus. Scientometrics (2013) 94: 020–942.

Nordforsk. 2010. International Research Cooperation in the Nordic Countries. A publication from the NORIAnet "Bibliometrics in research policy and evaluation activities". Ed. by Gunnarsson, Magnus.

OECD. 2013. OECD Science, Technology and Industry Scoreboard 2013, OECD Publishing.

Puuska, Hanna-Mari, Muhonen, Reetta & Leino, Yrjö. 2013. International and domestic co-publishing and their citation impact in different disciplines. Scientometrics. Published online: 22 November 2013.

Scellato, Giuseppe, Franzoni, Chiara, & Stephan, Paula. 2015. Migrant scientists and international networks. Research Policy. 44 (2015), 108–120.

Science Europe & Elsevier. 2013. Comparative Benchmarking of European and US Research Collaboration and Research Mobility. A report prepared in collaboration between Science Europe and Elsevier's SciVal Analytics. September 2013.

Stephan, Paula & Levin, Sharon G. 2001. Exceptional contributions to US science by the foreign-born and foreign-educated. Population Research and Policy Review 20, 59–79.

Resources

Cole, Stephen & Phelan, Thomas J. 1999. The Scientific Productivity of Nations. Minerva 37, 1-13.

Crespi Gustavo A. & Geuna Aldo. 2008. An empirical study of scientific production: A cross country analysis, 1981-2002. Research Policy 37 (2008), 565-579.

King, David A. 2004. The scientific impact of nations. Nature, Vol. 430, July 2004, 311–316.

May, Robert M. 1997. The Scientific Wealth of Nations. Science, Vol. 275, Issue 5301, 793–796.

May, Robert M. 1998. The Scientific Inventions of Nations. Science, Vol. 281, Issue 5373, 49-51.

Rushton, J.P & Meltzer, S 1981. Research Productivity, University Revenue, and Scholarly Impact (Citations) of 169 British, Canadian and United States Universities (1977). Scientometrics, Vol. 3, No 4 (1981), 287–303.

Shelton, Robert A. 2008. Relations between national research investment and publication output: Application to an American Paradox. Scientometrics, Vol. 74, No. 2 (2008), 191–205.