

Appendix

Olli Poropudas

Explaining the national differences in the level of scientific research – a review of literature

Selected literature

General explanations

Adams, Jonathan. 1998. Benchmarking international research. *Nature*. Vol. 396, 17 December, 615–618.

Aghion, Philippe, Dewatripont, Mathias, Hoxby, Caroline, Mas-Colell, Andreu & Saper, Andre 2007. Why reform Europe's universities? Bruegel Policy Brief 4/2007. 101–113.

Ben-David, Joseph. 1960. Scientific Productivity and Academic Organization in Nineteenth Century Medicine. *American Sociological Review*, Vol. 25, No 6 (Dec., 1960), 828–843.

Bland, Carole J., & Ruffin, Mack T. 1992. Characteristics of a Productive Research Environment: Literature Review. *Acad. Med.* 67 (1992), Number 6, 385–397.

DFA. 2016a. Links between research policy and national academic performance. A comparative study of Denmark, Sweden and the Netherlands. Main Report. Commissioned by the Danish Council for Research and Innovation-policy (DFIR) and carried out a consortium consisting of CFA, Technopolis Group and NIFU.

DFA. 2016b. Links between research policy and national academic performance. A comparative study of Denmark, Sweden and the Netherlands. Background Report. Commissioned by the Danish Council for Research and Innovation-policy (DFIR) and carried out a consortium consisting of CFA, Technopolis Group and NIFU.

DFIR 2014. Viden i spil. Danmark Forsknings- og Innovationspolitiske Råds årsrapport 2014.

Hollingsworth, J. Rogers & Gear, David M. 2012. The Rise and Decline of Hegemonic Systems of Scientific Creativity. *Social Science Research Network*. Posted June 10, 2012.

Horta, Hugo. 2009. Global and national prominent universities: internationalization, competitiveness and the role of the state. *High. Educ.* (2009) 58: 387–405.

Karlsson, Staffan & Persson, Olle. 2014. The production of highly cited papers. Tables and graphs from the report “The Swedish production of highly cited papers” complemented with statistics for Norway. In: Benner, Mats & Öquist, Gunnar. 2014. Room for increased ambitions? Governing breakthrough research in Norway 1990–2013. Report to the Research Council of Norway.

Öquist, Gunnar & Brenner, Mats. Fostering breakthrough research: A comparative study. *Akademirapport*. Kung. Vetenskapsakademien. December 2012.

Öquist, Gunnar & Benner, Mats. 2015. Why Are Some Nations More Successful Than Others in Research Impact? A Comparison Between Denmark and Sweden. In: *Incentives and Performance. Governance of Research Organizations*. Ed. by Welppe, Isabell M., Wollershem, Jutta, Ringelhan, Stefanie & Osterloh, Margit. Springer 2015, 241–257.

Excellent researchers

Abramo, Giovanni, Cicero, Tindaro & D'Angelo Ciriaco Andrea. 2013. The impact of unproductive and top researchers on overall university research performance. *Journal of Informetrics* 7 (2013), 166–175.

- Abramo, Giovanni, D'Angelo, Ciriaco Andrea & Soldatenkova, Anastasia. 2016. The ratio of top scientists to the academic staff as an indicator of the competitive strength of universities. *Journal of Informetrics*. 10 (2016), 596–605.
- Allison, Paul D. 1980. Inequality and Scientific Productivity. *Social Studies of Science*, Vol. 10, No. 2 (May, 1980), 163–179.
- Azolay, Pierre, Zivin, Joshua S. Graff & Wang, Jialan. 2010. Superstar Extinction. *The Quarterly Journal of Economics*, May 2010. 549–589
- Basu, Aparna. 2006. Using ISI's 'Highly Cited Researchers' to obtain a country level indicators of citation excellence. *Scientometrics*, Vol. 68, No. 3 (2006), 361–375.
- Batty, Michael. 2003. Citation Geography: It's About Location. *The Scientist*, Volume 17, Issue 18, 10, Aug. 25, 2003.
- Bornman, Lutz & Bauer, Johann. 2015. Which of the world's institutions employ the most highly cited researchers? An analysis of the data from highlycited.com. *Journal of the Association for Information Science and Technology*. Vol. 66, Issue 10, 2146–2148.
- Cole, Jonathan. 1970. Patterns of Intellectual Influence in Scientific Research. *Sociology of Education*, 1970, Vol. 43 (Fall), 377–403.
- Cole, Stephen & Cole, Jonathan R. 1967. Scientific Output and Recognition: A Study in the Operation of the Reward System in Science. *American Sociological Review*, Volume 32, Issue 3 (Jun., 1967), 377–390.
- Feist, Gregory J. 1997. Quantity, Quality, and Depth of Research as Influences on Scientific Eminence: Is Quantity Most Important? *Creativity Research Journal* 199, Vol. 10, No. 4, 325–335.
- Gazni, Ali & Ghaseminik, Zahra. 2015. Author practices in citing other authors, institutions, and journals. *Journal of the Association for International Science and Technology*, Volume 67, Issue 10, pp. 2536–2549.
- Hicks, Diana. 2011. Equity and Excellence in Research Funding. *Minerva*, 49 (2), 137–151.
- Lotka, Alfred J. 1926. The frequency distribution of scientific productivity. *Journal of the Washington Academy of Sciences*. Vol. 16, No. 12, 317–323.
- Price, Derek J. De Solla. 1986. *Little Science, Big Science... and Beyond*. Columbia University Press.

Recruitment, endogamy

- Abramo, Giovanni, D'Angelo, Ciriaco Andrea & Rosati, Francesco. 2014c. Career advancement and scientific performance in universities. *Scientometrics* (2014) 98, 891–907.
- Abramo, Giovanni, D'Angelo, Ciriaco Andrea, Rosati, Francesco. 2015. The determinants of academic career advancement: Evidence from Italy. *Science and Public Policy*, 42 (6), 761–774.
- Allison, Paul D. & Long, J. Scott. 1990. Departmental Effects on Scientific Productivity. *American Sociological Review*, Vol. 55, NO. 4 (Aug. 1990), 469–478.
- Aydogan, Ismail. 2012. The Existence of favoritism in organizations. *African Journal of Business Management*, Vol. 6 (12), 4577–4586.
- Bland, Carole J., Center, Bruce A., Risbey, Kelly J. & Staples, Justin. 2006. The Impact of Appointment Type on the Productivity and Commitment of Full-Time Faculty in Research and Doctoral Institutions. *The Journal of Higher Education*, Vol. 77, No. 1 (January/February 2006), 89–123.
- Blau, Peter M. 1973. *The Organization of Academic Work*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Bonaccorsi, Andrea & Cicero, Tindaro. 2016. Distributed or Concentrated Research Excellence? Evidence From a Large-Scale Research Assessment Exercise. *Journal of the Association for Information Science and Technology*, 67(12), 2976–2992.
- Cole, Stephen. 1992. *Making Science. Between Nature and Society*. Harvard University Press.
- Deloitte. 2014. *Researcher's Report 2014. Final Report*. European Commission. DG Research and Innovation.
- Eisenberg, Theodore & Wells, Martin T. 2000. Inbreeding in Law School Hiring: Assessing the Performance of Faculty Hired from Within. *Journal of Legal Studies*, vol. XXIX (January 2000), 369–388.

- Hargens, Lowell L. & Farr, Grant M. 1973. An Examination of Recent Hypotheses About Institutional Inbreeding. *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 78, No.6 (May, 1973), 1381–1402.
- Horta, Hugo. 2013. Understanding the pros and cons of academic inbreeding. *University World News*. 11. October 2013 Issue No: 291.
- Horta, Hugo. 2014. Open, merit-based and transparent recruitment. Final paper for the 2014 ERAC mutual learning workshop on Human Resources and Mobility. Brussels, March 26, 2014.
- Horta, Hugo, Veloso, Francisco M., Grediaga, Rocio. 2010. Navel Gazing: Academic Inbreeding and Scientific productivity. *Management Science*, Vol. 56, No. 3, March 2010, 414–429.
- Höhle, Ester Ava. 2017. Early Career Researchers and their Intention to leave Academia in Differing Employment Regimes across Europe. *CHER 30th Annual Conference*.
- Janger, Jurgen & Nowotny, Klaus. 2013. Career choices in academia. *WWWforEurope Working Paper*, No. 36.
- Janger, Jurgen, Strauss, Anna & Campbell, David F.J. 2013. Academic careers: a cross-country perspective. *WWWforEurope, Working Paper 37*.
- Marimon, Ramon, Lietaert, Matthieu & Grigolo, Michele. 2009. Towards the ‘Fifth Freedom’: Increasing the Mobility of Researchers in the European Union. *Higher Education in Europe*, Vol. 34, No. 1, April 2009, 25–37.
- Martin, Brian. 2009. Academic patronage. *The International Journal for Education Integrity*, Vol. 5, No. 1, June 2009, 3–19.
- Metcalf, Hilary, Rolfe, Heather, Stevens, Philip & Weale, Martin. 2005. Recruitment and Retention of Academic Staff in Higher Education. National Institute of Economic and Social Research. Research Report No 658.
- Niland, John. 2007. The Challenges of Building World-Class Universities. In: *The World-Class University and Ranking: Aiming Beyond Status*. Ed. by Sadlak, Jan & Nian Cai, Liu. *Unesco-Cepes*, 61–72.
- Olsen, Terje Bruen, Kyvik, Svein & Hovdhaugen, Elisabeth. 2005. The promotion to full professor – through competition or by individual competence? *Tertiary Education and Management* (2005) 11, 299–316.
- Salmi, Jamil. 2009. The Challenge of Establishing World-Class Universities. The World Bank, Washington D.C.
- Technopolis. 2014. IA study on the Open, transparent, and merit-based recruitment of researchers.
- Wyer, Jean C. & Conrad, Clifton F. 1984. Institutional Inbreeding Reexamined. *American Educational Research Journal*. Spring 1984, Vol. 1, 213–225.
- Yang, Bo, Rousseau, Ronald, Haung, Shuiqing & Yan, Sulan. 2015. Do first rate scientists work at first rate organizations? *Malaysian Journal of Library & Information Science*, Vol. 20, no. 1, 2015, 47–60.
- Zinovyeva, Natalia & Bagues, Manuel F. 2012. The role of connections in academic promotions. Discussion Paper series, *Forschungsinstitut zur Zukunft der Arbeit*, No. 6821

Research time

- Bentley, Peter James & Kyvik, Svein. 2013. Individual Differences in Faculty Research Time Allocation Across 13 Countries. *Research in Higher Education*, May 2013, Volume 54, Issue 3, 329–348.
- Crespi, Gustavo A. & Geuna, Aldo. 2004. The Productivity of Science. Report prepared for the Office of Science and Technology, Department of Trade and Industry, SPRU – University of Sussex. July 2004.
- Fairweather, James S. 2002. The Mythologies of Faculty Productivity. *The Journal of Higher Education*, Vol. 73, No. 1 (January/February 2002), 26–48.
- Fox, Mary Fran 1992. Research, Teaching, and Publication Productivity: Mutuality Versus Competition in Academia Author(s). *Sociology of Education*, Vol. 65, No. 4 (Oct., 1992), 293–305.
- Gottlieb, Esther E. & Keith, Bruce. 1997. The academic research-teaching nexus in eight advanced-industrialized countries. *Higher Education* 34, 397–420.

Hattie, John & Marsh, H. W. 1996. The Relationship Between Research and Teaching: A Meta-Analysis. *Review of Educational Research*; Winter 1996, Vol. 66, No. 4, 507–542.

Kyvik, Sven & Smeby, Jens-Christian. 1994. Teaching and research. The relationship between the supervision of graduate students and faculty research performance. *Higher Education* 28: 227–239.

Olson, E. Jeffrey. 1994. Institutional and technical constraints on faculty gross productivity in American doctoral universities. *Research in Higher Education*, Vol. 35, No. 5, 1994, 549–567.

Simon, Rita James. 1974. The Work Habits of Eminent Scholars. *Sociology of Work and Occupations*, Vol. 1 No. 3, August 1974, 327–33.

White, Charles S., James, Karen, Burke, Lisa A. & Allen, Richard S. 2012. What makes a “research star”? Factors influencing the research productivity of business faculty, *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management*, Vol. 61, Iss 6, 584–602.

Autonomy, management

Hemlin, Sven, Allwood, Carl Martin & Martin, Ben. 2008. Creative Knowledge Environments. *Creativity Research Journal*, 20(2), 196–210.

Hollingsworth, J. Rogers. 2008. Scientific Discoveries: An Institutional and Path-Dependent Perspective. Biomedical and health research commission of the European communities.

Competition

Aagard, Kaare & Schneider, Jesper W. 2016. Research funding and national academic performance: Examination of a Danish success story. *Science and Public Policy*, 43(4), 2016, 518–531.

Abramo, Giovanni, Cicero, Tindaro, & D’Angelo, Ciriaco Andrea. 2012. The dispersion of research performance within and between universities as potential indicators of the competitive intensity in higher education systems. *Journal of Informetrics* 6 (2012), 155–168.

Abramo, Giovanni & D’Angelo, Ciriaco Andrea & Di Costa, Flavia. 2014. Variability of research performance across disciplines within universities in non-competitive higher education systems. *Scientometrics*, February 2014, Volume 98, Issue 2, 777–795.

Auranen, Otto ja Nieminen, Mika. 2010. University research funding and publication performance – An international comparison. *Research Policy* 39 (2010), 822–834.

Ben-David, Joseph. 1960. Scientific Productivity and Academic Organization in Nineteenth Century Medicine. *American Sociological Review*, Vol. 25, No 6 (Dec., 1960), 828–843.

Besselaar van, Peter, Heyman, Ulf & Sandström, Ulf. 2017. Perverse effects of output-based research funding? Butler’s Australian case revisited. *Journal of Informetrics* 11 (2017), 905–918.

Geuna, Aldo. 2001. The Changing Rationale for European University Research Funding: Are There Negative Unintended Consequence? *Journal of Economic Issues*. Vol. XXXV No. 3 September 2001, 607–632.

Geuna, Aldo, Martin, Ben R. 2003. University Research Evaluation and Funding: An International Comparison. *Minerva* 41, 277–304.

Heinze, Thomas, Shapira, Philip, Rogers, Juan D. & Senker, Jacqueline M. 2009. Organizational and institutional influences on creativity in scientific research. *Research Policy* 38 (2009), 610–623.

Jonkers, Koen & Zacharewicz, Thomas. 2016. Research Based Funding Systems: a Comparative Assessment. JRC Science for Policy Report. European Union.

Kyvik, Svein. 2013. The academic researcher role: enhancing expectations and improved performance. *Higher Education* (2013), 65:525–538.

Kyvik, Stein. 2007. Changes in Funding University Research: Consequences for Problem Choice and Research Output of Academic Staff. In: *Public-Private Dynamics in Higher Education. Expectations, Developments and Outcomes*. Ed. by Enders, Jurgen & Jonbloed, Ben. Bielefeld, 387–409.

Liefner, Ingo. 2003. Funding, resource allocation, and performance in higher education systems. *Higher Education* 46: 469–489, 2003.

Marginson, Simon. 2006. Dynamics of national and global competition in higher education. *Higher Education* (2006) 52: 1–19.

Sandström, Ulf, Heyman, Ulf & van Besselaar, Peter. 2014. The Complex Relationship between Competitive Funding and Performance. In: *Proceedings of the science and technology indicators conference 2014 Leiden*. Universiteit Leiden – CWTS, 523–533.

Schmidt, Evanthia Kalpazidou. 2012. University Funding Reforms in the Nordic Countries. *The Journal of Finance and Management in Colleges and Universities* 3: 8, 113–136.

Ylijoki, Oili-Helena, Lyytinen, Anu & Marttila, Liisa. 2011. Different research market: a disciplinary perspective. *High. Educ.* (2011) 62, 721–740,

Economies of scale, concentration

Abramo, Giovanni, Cicero, Tindaro & D'Angelo Ciriaco Andrea. 2012. Revisiting size effect in higher education research productivity. *High. Educ.* (2012) 63, 701–717.

Blackburn, Robert, Behymer, Charles E. & Hall, David. 1978. Research Note: Correlates of Faculty Publications. *Sociology of Education* 1978, Vol. 51 (April), 132–141.

Bloch, Carter, Schneider, Jesper W. & Sinkjaer, Thomas. 2016. Size, Accumulation and Performance for Research Grants: Examining the Role of Size for Centres of Excellence. *PLoS ONE* 11(2): e0147726.

Bonaccorsi, Andrea & Cinzia, Daraio. 2005. Exploring size and agglomeration effects on public research productivity. *Scientometrics*, Vol. 63, No 1 (2005), 87–120.

Bonaccorsi, Andrea, Daraio, Cinzia & Simar, Leopold. 2007. Efficiency and productivity in European universities: exploring trade-offs in the strategic profile. In: *Universities and Strategic Knowledge Creation. Specialization and Performance in Europe*. Ed. by Bonaccorsi, Andrea & Daraio, Cinzia. Edward Elgar, 144–193.

Dubois, Pierre, Rochet, Jean-Pierre & Schlenker, Jean-Marc. 2014. Productivity and Mobility in Academic Research: Evidence from Mathematics. *Scientometrics*, March 2014, Volume 98, Issue 3, 1669–1701.

Ebadi, Ashkan & Schiffauerova, Andrea. 2016. How to boost scientific production? A statistical analysis of research funding and other influencing factors. *Scientometrics*. Published online: 04 January 2016.

Fortin, Jean-Michael & Currie, David J. 2013. Big Science vs. Little Science: How Scientific Impact Scales with Funding. *PLoS ONE* 8(6):e65263.

Hollingsworth, J. Rogers. 2008. Scientific Discoveries: An Institutional and Path-Dependent Perspective. *Biomedical and health research commission of the European communities*.

Jordan, John M., Meador, Mark & Walters, Stephen J.K. 1989. Academic Research Productivity, Department Size and Organization: Further Results. *Economics of Education Review*, Vol. 8, No. 4, 345–352

Kyvik, Svein. 1995. Department size and resources for administration. *Tertiary Education and Management*, 1:1, 107–108.

Kyvik, Svein. 1995 (b). Are big universities better than smaller ones? *Higher Education* 1995, Volume 30, Issue 3, 295–304.

Langfeldt, Liv, Benner, Mats, Sivertsen, Gunnar, Kristiansen, Ernst H., Aksnes, Dag W., Brostad, Siri Borlaug, Hansen, Foss Hanne, Kallerud, Egil & Pelkonen, Antti. 2015. Excellence and growth dynamics: A comparative study of the Matthew effect. *Science and Public Policy* 42 (2015), 661–675.

Seglen, Per O. & Aksnes, Dag W. 2000. Scientific productivity and group size: A bibliometric analysis of Norwegian microbiological research. *Scientometrics*, Vol. 49, No. 1 (2000), 125–143.

Tunzelmann von, Nick, Ranga, Marina, Martin, Ben & Geuna, Aldo. 2003. *The Effects of Size on Research Performance: A SPRU Review*. SPRU. University of Sussex at Brighton.

International collaboration

- Abramo, Giovanni, D'Angelo, Ciriaco & Solazzi, Marco. 2011. The relationship between scientists' research performance and the degree of internationalization of their research. *Scientometrics* (2011) 86, 629–643
- Adams, Jonathan. 2013. The fourth age of research. *Nature*, Volume 497, 2013, 557–560.
- Bornmann, Lutz. 2017. Is collaboration among scientists related to the citation impact of papers because their quality increases with collaboration? An analysis based on data from F1000Prime and normalized citation scores. *Journal of the Association for Information Science and Technology*. Volume 68, Issue 4, April 2017, 1036–1047.
- Fanelli, Daniele & Lariviere, Vincent. 2015. Are scientists really publishing more? *ISSI* 2015, 652–653.
- Fanelli, Daniele & Lariviere, Vincent. 2016. Researchers' Individual Publication Rate Has Not Increased in a Century. *PLOS ONE* 11(3).
- Franzoni, Chiara, Scellato, Giuseppe & Stephan, Paula, 2012. The Mover's Advantage: Scientific Performance of Mobile Academics. NBER Working Paper No. 18577. November 2012.
- Franzoni, Chiara, Scellato, Giuseppe & Stephan, Paula. 2012. Foreign-born scientists: mobility patterns for 16 countries. *Nature Biotechnology*, Volume 30 Number 12 December 2012.
- Franzoni, Chiara, Scellato, Giuseppe & Stephan, Paula. 2015. International Mobility of Research Scientists: Lessons from GlobSci. In: *Global Mobility of Research Scientists. The Economics of Who GOES WHERE and Why*. Ed. by Geuna, Aldo. Academic Press.
- Luukkonen, Terttu, Persson, Olle & Sivertsen, Gunnar. 1992. Understanding Patterns of International Scientific Collaboration. *Science, Technology, & Human Values*. Vol. 17 No. 1, Winter 1992, 101–126.
- Mamisheishvili, Ketevan & Rosser, Vicki J. 2009. International and Citizen Faculty in the United States: An Examination of their Productivity at Research Universities. *Res. High. Educ.* (2010) 51, 88–107.
- Moed, Hank, Aisali, M'hamed & Plume, Andrew. 2012. Studying scientific migration in Scopus. *Scientometrics* (2013) 94: 020–942.
- Nordforsk. 2010. International Research Cooperation in the Nordic Countries. A publication from the NORIA-net "Bibliometrics in research policy and evaluation activities". Ed. by Gunnarsson, Magnus.
- OECD. 2013. OECD Science, Technology and Industry Scoreboard 2013, OECD Publishing.
- Puuska, Hanna-Mari, Muhonen, Reetta & Leino, Yrjö. 2013. International and domestic co-publishing and their citation impact in different disciplines. *Scientometrics*. Published online: 22 November 2013.
- Scellato, Giuseppe, Franzoni, Chiara, & Stephan, Paula. 2015. Migrant scientists and international networks. *Research Policy*. 44 (2015), 108–120.
- Science Europe & Elsevier. 2013. Comparative Benchmarking of European and US Research Collaboration and Research Mobility. A report prepared in collaboration between Science Europe and Elsevier's SciVal Analytics. September 2013.
- Stephan, Paula & Levin, Sharon G. 2001. Exceptional contributions to US science by the foreign-born and foreign-educated. *Population Research and Policy Review* 20, 59–79.

Resources

- Cole, Stephen & Phelan, Thomas J. 1999. The Scientific Productivity of Nations. *Minerva* 37, 1—13.
- Crespi Gustavo A. & Geuna Aldo. 2008. An empirical study of scientific production: A cross country analysis, 1981-2002. *Research Policy* 37 (2008), 565-579.
- King, David A. 2004. The scientific impact of nations. *Nature*, Vol. 430, July 2004, 311–316.
- May, Robert M. 1997. The Scientific Wealth of Nations. *Science*, Vol. 275, Issue 5301, 793–796.
- May, Robert M. 1998. The Scientific Inventions of Nations. *Science*, Vol. 281, Issue 5373, 49–51.
- Rushton, J.P & Meltzer, S 1981. Research Productivity, University Revenue, and Scholarly Impact (Citations) of 169 British, Canadian and United States Universities (1977). *Scientometrics*, Vol. 3, No 4 (1981), 287–303.

Shelton, Robert A. 2008. Relations between national research investment and publication output: Application to an American Paradox. *Scientometrics*, Vol. 74, No. 2 (2008), 191–205.