**Supplemental Materials**

*Coding strategy, descriptions of codes, and example open-coded text related to perspectives toward collaboration among field managers working for the United States Bureau of Land Management*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Axial code | Open code | Number of coded segments | Code descriptions | Example Quotes |
| Listening and Communication |  |  |  |  |
|  | Surface listening | 15 | "Hear people out" | ***Interviewer****: Are there some skills in collaboration that you think could be taught in a classroom that would be beneficial to people? I know that's an abstract question.*  ***Participant 18****: Really, I think it's the skill of actually being able to listen and not to react. Especially in the early meetings, there's a lot of finger‑pointing, because everyone's going to voice their opinion on matters. The more people you have in the room, the more opinions there are going to be, and they're going to be all different.*  *There's going to be stuff said, especially from an agency perspective that we definitely don't agree with. Really, it's more of a listening and not reacting, when you hear something that doesn't fit with what you're thinking.* |
|  | Sincerity/honesty /transparency | 47 | Be sincere and transparent when communicating with stakeholders | ***Participant 3:*** *It's about the process. We need to engage the public. We have a responsibility, as public servants, to protect the public trust. Part of that is the transparency of what we're doing, how we are doing it.* |
|  | Humility | 27 | Demonstrates willingness to admit mistakes in conversation | ***Participant 12****: No, I think that's part of the art versus the science of the whole management versus leadership. There's no question that I'll admit to falling flat on my face numerous times. I know I've done it, and I know I will. It's just that those people who give me the opportunity time and time again, even after I've fallen short, or I haven't lived up to an expectation...I think it's a never‑ending process, to tell you the truth. The more experiences you have the better prepared you are, but you're never going to have it dialed. The day I've got it figured out is the day I do retire, because I don't think I'll ever have it figured out.* |
|  | Empathy | 12 | Demonstrates ability to understand and share the feelings of another through conversation | ***Participant 5:*** *When that stuff falls down, that's a big pitfall. I don't know, I think it comes down to those basic things. Understanding other folks viewpoints, listening, looking for the common ground, making sure you're understanding what they're saying, and really trying to pull that out of people.* |
|  | Two-way communication | 34 | Mentions the importance of focusing on two-way communication to understand each other’s points of view | ***Interviewer****: Let me ask you another question, then, also about training. Do you think that collaboration and dispute resolution require a different skill set, and if so, what do you think it is?*  ***Participant 12****: I don't know, Interviewer, if I think it's a different skill set. It's one that we just don't...I can't say don't foster, but I think listening skills and compassion and emotional intelligence. Just being able to read people's emotions and react based on emotion and putting yourself in their shoes. Because to me, if you can't understand where they're coming from and truthfully understand it, that makes it more challenging.* |
|  | Deep listening | 30 | Mentions the importance of focusing on deep listening and demonstrates passion to use deep listening to understand diverse partners | ***Interviewer****: I think I know what soft skills mean to be, but when you think of soft skills, what are you thinking of, specifically?*  ***Participant 15****: The time that it takes, to really sit back and listen, to empathize, the time it takes to be sharing up themselves, in order to allow the other entities to develop abilities. The ability to share thoughts and feelings, and values, the openness, of opening up yourself to others, and then, at the same time, when others open up to you, to make sure that that's a safe environment, you don't take advantage of those. Does that help?* |
| Response to problem solving/conflict - others |  |  |  |  |
|  | Collaborative conflict style - others | 3 | Describes how others exhibit a collaborative conflict style and tendency to work toward mutually beneficial solutions | ***Participant 15****: For the examples? Certainly, from a resource management, land use planning standpoint, degrees of collaboration are great. Bring in the stakeholders. Down here in [removed for anonymity] there seems to be more of a willingness to share decision space. For here there's a [removed for anonymity] Advisory Council, there are Friends' groups. The Friends' groups are part of whole host of stakeholders on any particular subject. There just seems to be a long history of the willingness to play nicely in the sandbox together, even on small things. Small areas, or even on larger areas.* |
|  | Competitive conflict style - others | 18 | Describes how others are focused on winning/goal-oriented (competitive) | ***Participant 4****: Again, when it's forced. The parties need to have at least the first thing they agree on is we might reach a better outcome that would be acceptable to all of us than if we pursue litigation or other dispute resolution practices. You can't have a reluctant participant, you can't have somebody drug in at the last minute.*  *You can't have much like collaboration someone whose only interest is disrupting the process or upsetting it or actively causing it to fail. There are groups, parties that have that intent and are quite open and honest about it. Certain environments is an example, but it's certainly industry, in some cases, or the other side of the spectrum we're always in the middle of, as well.* |
|  | Conflict averse - others | 4 | Notes that others tend to avoid conflict-laden situations | ***Participant 18****: Comfort level and not wanting some people. If you already have the project conceived, you don't want to hear other ideas. You want to get going on, on what you think should be done. Most people don't like conflict. There's always going to be conflict. Quite often, I believe conflict is good because it makes you think.* |
| Response to problem solving/conflict - self |  |  |  |  |
|  | Conflict averse - self | 2 |  | ***Interviewer****: Sure. Other things that come to mind, things that don't work very well in collaboration?*  ***Participant 5****: I think, sometimes, you know what I said about being inclusive, making sure you get all the right folks there? That's generally the way to go. At times, there's probably...I'm trying to think where we've had...Maybe it's like putting cats and dogs together. If we were to manage those separately, that might have gotten us further than having all of the same parties in the same room that were diametrically opposed to what we needed to get to. Everyone had real different views, and that maybe can short circuit you sometimes.*  ***Interviewer****: Meeting with people separately at some point in the process?*  ***Participant 5****: Not always, it's just sometimes you'll get those groups that are really far apart. Trying to get those folks to sit down and work collaboratively is probably not realistic, or it backfires on you.* |
|  | Competitive conflict style - self | 16 | Expresses a competitive conflict style that is about “winning” | ***Interviewer****: Interesting. What led to that change? How'd that come about?*  ***Participant 13****: We let them take some responsibility for this stuff. I guess that's collaboration, like the horse darting. They knew that we were going do it. They knew that we wouldn't back down and that we were going to gather horses if we needed to. There's some threat out there for them. On our part, we said we're going to do it, but we're going to do it this way and not so inhumane. They've accepted that.*  *They've come out in the press and supported some stuff, like the birth control and the way we gather our horses here. We had a plan three or four years ago, how to get some of the groups involved. We're at the tail ends of that. It's kind of come together, but I don't know if I'd call it collaboration.* |
|  | Collaborative conflict style - self | 14 | Exhibits a collaborative conflict style and tendency to work toward mutually beneficial solutions | ***Interviewer****: Thinking about your experience with collaboration, in what situations have you found collaboration to be beneficial?*  ***Participant 20****: I would say where the pain of not solving the problem is important to...everyone's feeling that pain, I guess, so it motivates the energy it takes to work it out.*  *Then, because some of these situations are multifaceted and affect a lot of people, the collaboration is effective, or is good, because different groups and entities can effect change on different aspects of the problem. It's clear they're not just helping out, like BLM or something. They've actually got a...not only feeling the pain of the problem, but have an aspect of something they could do that would make it better.* |
|  | Not conflict averse - self | 18 | Not averse to conflict; does not avoid conflict | ***Participant 2****: From my perspective, you have folks come for a tribal consultation meeting and the tribe wants to go into consult, that's how it is. Anyway, they want to talk amongst themselves and kick us out of the room. In fact, half the meeting we're sitting in this other room not doing anything and them talking. Then they come back and they...It's one of those really uncomfortable ones where they've got themselves all riled up and then they just ring me up and everything. By the next day, we're all talking. I don't think you can do anything about that. That's the way that they want. They want a united front and they don't get a chance to chat with their whole group that often so they need to get the other office [inaudible 39:12] . They talk to us and say, "Let's move forward from here."* |
| Context |  |  |  |  |
|  | Community involvement | 12 | The interviewee is involved in the community and uses these relationships as a foundation for collaborative relationships within a natural resource management context | ***Participant 20****: I guess I subscribe to that quote somebody made that says nobody cares about how much you know until they know how much you care philosophy. You've got to do something that makes people know that you care about what you're doing. I think in a culture where people are rewarded for moving around, it's easier to make decisions that are going to have adverse effects on people if you aren't going to have to live there and live with the people who are affected by those.* |
|  | Institutional context | 107 | Provides details related to institutional context - e.g., attrition in the workplace | ***Participant 7****: That's a really good question. We struggle, and I think this is probably true of any hierarchical organization like that. There's always this field‑headquarters disconnect [laughs] . It was in the military too, where we don't feel we often get what we need. What we need is high‑level political cover, and we need people like the director to stand up and explain what the BLM's mission is, why grazing is not a right, why having a water right doesn't give you a right to...dispel some of these persistent media rumors, because what's happening is we're being forced to do it individually at our levels.* |
|  | Difficult relationships | 39 | Indicates that the relationships with stakeholders are already strained or lacking trust | **P*articipant 17****: There's two big aspects to the natural resource. One, there's external relationships, and two, the natural resource management. I'll start with the first. The [Removed for Anonymity] field office is in [Removed for Anonymity] County in [Removed for Anonymity, which is a very pro state's rights, anti federal government state and county. Probably, my understanding, [Removed for Anonymity] is the most extreme of most of the other [Removed for Anonymity] counties. It is a very trying, at best, situation with the county. There's a lot of history that I can't go too in detail. I would be glad to at another time, go into detail, of where the relationships between the BLM and the county commissioners and the county government staff and the county residents is extremely challenged. That relationship with all those groups is extremely challenged because of some history of activities in the county area. It's been difficult in the slightly less than a year that I've been here to move forward as I would like in a very collaborative partnership nature, as I'm used to doing.* |
|  | Personal background | 18 | Personal background of the interviewee - e.g., degree focus | ***Participant 3:*** *Especially because my background is in NEPA and planning, I have a lot of planning training. It's always the topic that comes up.* |
|  | Personality/ personal interest/awareness | 25 | Personality of the interviewee and ways in which this might interact with personalities of stakeholders; e.g., introvert/extrovert, and self-awareness of one's own personality or learning style and reflection on how that might help or hinder collaborative efforts, or ability to learn about improving collaboration. Also, the interviewee’s interests in terms of working with natural resources versus working with people. | ***Interviewer****: What do you think the hardest part of collaboration is, other than the time crunch?*  ***Participant 14****: Probably for me is, I'm just kind of an introvert type of person. Taking that first step of introducing myself and trying to strike up a conversation is probably the most difficult part for me. A lot of federal land managers fall into that introvert category because they grew up outside and in the woods. Something in their environment pushed them to be more of an introverted type of person, rather than outgoing, wanting to be around everybody and listen to everything they have to say. That's the difficult part for me.* |
|  | Local issues | 106 | Local issues dealt with by the interviewee's field station; could also include prior experiences with local issues through past positions | **Participant 7**: Yeah, I administer the largest hard rock mining program in the nation. We have I think the third‑largest grazing program, the second‑largest horse program, renewable energy, recreation, some oil and gas ‑‑ pretty much the whole suite outside of scenic rivers [laughs]. Yeah, it is a very hard‑charging area in the heart of the BLM. If you look at the land status map, [Removed for Anonymity]’s mostly yellow. My district, we're in the heart of that yellow [laughs] sea. This is the last grazing district formed in the entire Bureau, so I'm dealing with some first‑ and second‑generation ranchers who in their lifetime had to deal with federal regulation. So we're fighting some primary battles out here that are resolved in other parts of the country. There are no issues there. |
| Agency Mission |  |  |  |  |
|  | Creates space | 21 | Creates space in agency mission to reach mutually beneficial solutions | ***Participant 9:*** *Don't necessarily always look for a way to say no, let's look for a way to say, "How do we do this and still, one, take care of the resource and two, take care of the people involved on both sides of this thing?" For our little office I think it's a mindset of how we go about doing our job.*  ***Participant 11:*** *A lot of times in the government we hear, "We can't do this. We can't do that." Let's focus on what we can do and figure out. Optimism or efficacy demonstrated through attitude or perspective* |
|  | Defensive - self | 45 | Defensive of agency mission/mandate | ***Participant 8****: The flip side is when your decision space becomes very narrow. As soon as that space becomes narrow, or you have one definitive decision that has to be made, because that space is narrow, I find that even if there are other areas surrounding decisions around that, if they are so impacted by that one decision. The community really feels frustrated trying to come up with innovative ideas of how they could do things. It keeps getting snubbed by that overriding decision ‑‑ or portions of it aren't accepted. I've been in a situation where I couldn't go to what I thought would be a collaborative planning approach, simply because of that. It would not have been a good way to try to do it, in my opinion.* |
|  | Defensive - others | 11 | Describes how others are defensive of agency mission/mandate | ***Participant 19*** *No, the only other times are when they don't know when the other agencies or the other groups that are part of the process have divergent goals then they're not up front. They're not truly upfront with why they're there. Then, that could be an issue. They may have some other reasons, underlying goals that they've buried. They may be hiding.* |
| Attitude or perspective |  |  |  |  |
|  | Negative attitude or perspective - self | 33 | Exhibits a negative attitude toward collaboration (i.e., a mandate to collaborate doesn't always make sense) | ***Participant 1:*** *We've got double times here regarding trespass issues. And it's a negotiation, right? And working with a person, whether it be livestock, whether it be recreational bulldozer driving as I like to refer to it. Unauthorized road building. Because I can read the regs and work my realty people and my range staff, and in some of these cases we certainly would have been duly justified to absolutely hammer some folks. And so, it really gets down to negotiation about resolving the issue. Sometimes, it's been the folks coming in, they've got a legitimate issue and they are trying to deal with it, and our process is just slow. Sometimes, there's just miscommunication, sometimes there's just stupidity...* |
|  | Negative attitude or perspective - others | 22 | Negative attitude or perspective toward collaboration demonstrated through how the individual discusses collaboration | ***Participant 16****: I know a general complaint is that collaboration tends to slow the process down, but once you build those ties, it really doesn't slow the process, once you have that trust established with the other partners and agencies.* |
|  | Positive attitude or perspective - self | 24 | Positive attitude or perspective toward collaboration demonstrated through how the individual discusses collaboration | ***Participant 12****: We discussed, obviously, a lot of things today. Collaboration. I just need to say it again. It's not easy, and it takes work. You've got to be willing to learn from your mistakes. That's some of that self‑reflection, humility, and being humble. [laughs]*  ***Interviewer****: It does take that. I agree.*  ***Participant 12****: Other than that, Interviewer, it's been a great discussion. I was a little edgy going. When I saw the questions, I'm like, "Oh, boy. This could be interesting." It's been great. I'm using it as a learning experience. A lot of things we've talked about that I realized I'm doing good, and there are some that I realized [laughs] I'm not doing so good.* |
|  | Positive attitude or perspective - others | 3 |  | ***Interviewer****: I appreciate that. Were people on board, when you made this presentation, where you argued, that partnership and team building are not the same as collaboration. And the real competency was this ability to collaborate, and people, does that resonate with people? How did people respond to that?*  ***Participant 17****: Very positively, as far as the leadership academy group, which had many existing field managers, a couple ADMs, and then, maybe 40 percent of the class were associate field managers, or resource specialists, or something working to advance their career. Very positive support, it's like, one of those aha moments, that, "Oh. Wow, yeah, that really does...that makes sense."* |
| Teaching and learning |  |  |  |  |
|  | Self-development of skills | 36 | Developed skills on one's own - "I've always been this way" or "I learned through my own experiences" | ***Interviewer****: The next one was how effective are the BLM's existing training courses and forms regarding collaboration? In your case, I refer back to the Leadership Academy, since that's where you might have had some of that training. I don't want to put words in your mouth, but would you say that it was highly effective?*  ***Participant 8****: No. What has been most effective for me is probably the informal on‑the‑job training.* |
|  | Not involved in seeking mentoring/training for staff/employees | 8 |  | ***Interviewer****: That's OK. This says, "You or your employees." Have you or one of your employees taken a BLM course you'd recommend to others? I'm wondering if maybe any of your employees have recently taken any BLM courses, about collaboration, that they might recommend.*  ***Participant 9****: No. It sounds bad, but no.*  ***Interviewer****: That's OK.*  ***Participant 9****: I can't think of any that we have had folks go through specifically on collaboration.* |
|  | Doesn't/hasn't/ can't attend training or training is dated | 24 | Reasons for not being involved in training. For example, expresses the idea that collaboration is already happening effectively and there is nothing left to learn. Discusses other reasons for not participating in training - lack of time, lack of money, lack of awareness. Training is generally not viewed as a priority. | ***Interviewer****: When you hear that message, "You're not being collaborative," do you think it mostly is because, as you said, BLM doesn't really know what's going on out there? Or, do you think there are some other things behind it?*  ***Participant 1:*** *We have so much stuff going on, everything is moving so fast, and it's so much information overload. I don't think it's just BLM. I think it's all agencies. There is so much stuff going on. Everything is moving so fast and bouncing off. I don't think people have time to delve into what we're doing. Everyone's so tied up in their own little world, I don't think they have time to dig into it. The news cycle is 24 hours, right? Everyone's worried about something showing up on the news, some senator calling, or something like that. I'm not sure we are doing a good enough job. We've had this discussion. How do we get information up the food chain about all the good stuff that we do here? What do you mean we're not being collaborative? We've got 21 permittees and 12 landowners, BLM, and all these folks doing these landscape‑scale sage grouse habitat improvement projects we call HLIs. There's huge...nobody does work at this scale. The only way you get to do this is by being collaborative, internally and externally, because you've got all these moving parts. How are we not being that way? We're doing that stuff and I'm not so sure anyone has anything to offer us on how to do it any better, honestly.* |
|  | Not involved in seeking mentoring/training for self | 15 | Not involved or interested in seeking mentoring or guidance | ***Interviewer****: Yeah, sure. Any other kind of training, maybe any leadership training that had any discussion of collaboration?*  ***Participant 13****: No, I'm not big on training, [laughs] for me, anyway. I haven't gone to training in years.*  ***Interviewer****: Can you tell me about that? Why are you not so enthusiastic about training?*  ***Participant 13****: It's not that I'm not enthusiastic. I just haven't gone too much. I've been to fire leadership and management. I guess that has some collaboration in.* |
|  | Seeks others with experience | 68 | Contacts others with experience in collaboration/ADR to discuss what worked and what didn’t. Typically, these would be internal resources within the bureau or other agencies (i.e., not public stakeholders or interest groups with different perspectives). | ***Participant 5:*** *There were a lot of times I would go in and say, "Here's what I'm thinking," or "Here's what I'm facing," or "Here's the situation we're dealing with, how do we work with these guys?" or "What would you suggest?" those kinds of things. It was practical one‑on‑one, hands‑on of kinds of stuff, working on the same projects, stuff that was really helpful. Those kinds of situations, I guess.* |
|  | Intentional approach to learning | 30 | Intentional approach to seeking information through courses and learning from others who have been successful. | ***Participant 2****: ...To learn a little bit more about cultural relations is beneficial. The one training I took was really good, and I probably should have taken, probably even that same one two or three times throughout my career. Because you catch some things each time you do that. Just help you work on those. And then take it again. I need to do this, too! I think that would have been a benefit.* |
|  | Observes others | 30 | Observes ways in which others (including supervisors and subordinates) engage in collaboration and thinks about how to apply to one's own situation. | ***Interviewer****: Do you feel like you have a way to learn, or have had a way to learn, collaboration techniques from others, sort of the things that we've talked about, watching how people do things, learning from those kind of experiences? Has that been part of your learning in collaboration? Or do you feel like every time you've been faced with something you've had to reinvent the wheel and figure it out yourself?*  ***Participant 12****: A lot of where I've gotten it from is just peer to peer. In different workings in different environments, I'll try to take note of different techniques, aspects, of a handful of people. Then if I see something, or see somebody, that knows, or that seems to be really comfortable, facilitating the collaborative effort, I'll tend to gravitate towards that person. Point in case, I had the great opportunity to work with some great people. Our Associate State Director, [Removed for Anonymity], was our acting Assistant Director of Fire and Aviation when I was at the Fire Center. He definitely has that collaborative feel about him. Along with different meetings and different experiences I've had on detail with the State Director of [Removed for Anonymity], [Removed for Anonymity]. The other one that really comes to mind is to be the Director of the National Operations Center, [Removed for Anonymity].They just have something about them that I tend to pick up on and then try to model my efforts off of.* |
|  | Incorporates feedback | 8 | Discusses the role of peer/supervisor feedback in their own learning about collaboration | ***Participant 21****: ...My district manager says that expectation early on in our relationship. I asked to trust her. I know that if I make a mistake, I can tell her about it but learn how do we move forward or say, I have a question on how to do something, she'll be straightforward, and she'll support me. The worst thing to do is to not keep your leadership in the loop, because it's something that happens.You want them to have your back. How can they have your back if they don't trust you or they're not aware with what's happening?* |
|  | Not involved in coaching/ mentoring others | 7 | Does not participate in opportunities to coach or mentor others. Also includes comments indicating that he or she has not been involved in facilitating training opportunities for staff. | ***Interviewer****: I want to go back to something you said a minute ago about your staff and their involvement and collaboration. How are they learning about collaboration, do you think?*  ***Participant 14****: Same way I'm learning, just by doing it. It's the best way. I don't know that we've got a lot of formal training set up to do that. You would think that I would have heard about it and I haven't.*  ***Interviewer****: Do you do debriefings? How do you bring them along, so that they're as effective as they can be in collaboration?*  ***Participant 14****: The best thing I can do is I try to lead by example and show them what I do. Not only that, but also learn by example. That's learn from what they're doing. Because there's a lot of new folks coming up with a lot of new ideas that older folks like myself have either stopped out and said, "OK, we tried that before. It's not going to work." Or just don't believe in.* |
|  | Promotes training opportunities for staff | 13 | Encourages staff to attend trainings | ***Participant 4****: ...We do make an effort to get employees to appropriate training. Particularly I emphasize new employees, new hires, I can get the biggest bang for your training dollar and it's going to benefit both the employees and the agency over the long run. Training and travel have been dramatically cut the last few years [laughs] which makes it even more important to prioritize.* |
|  | Coaches/mentors others | 42 | Intentional approach to coaching and mentoring others - seeks opportunities to provide coaching and mentoring to subordinates through, for example, job shadowing - empowering them to engage in collaborating themselves. | ***Interviewer****: In terms of how you pass along what you've learned to others, what's that look like for you over the years?*  ***Participant 10****: For me, it's I hope the people that I mentor can see what works and what doesn't, by the way I treat them, and by the way I treat others. That for me has worked as well as anything. My advice to people that get into this is, "Just treat people the way you want to be treated, and you'll do well." I've lived by that approach as long as I've been in the government, and it has worked well for me.* |
|  | Provide people with opportunity to try using collaboration/ADR | 7 |  | ***Participant 12:*** *One of my other duties, as assigned, is to help foster that in them and kind of...not formally mentor but provide that not only expectation that that's what is expected of them but provide the opportunities to work and grow within the collaborative effort. So yeah, I take that responsibility is definitely highly important. Hopefully, I'm offering opportunities that they can embrace it every day.* |
| Approach to collaboration and metrics of success |  |  |  |  |
|  | Leadership - own role as a leader, class | 32 | Discusses the importance of leading or commanding a collaborative effort "you've got to bring your agency”, or attending trainings on leadership or management | **Participant 1:** If you're going to collaborate, you've got to be a leader, too. If you're not leading the collaboration, but you've got to be a leader. You've got to lead your agency. You've got to lead the people through this process. I don't see collaboration and leadership as being separate issues. They're tied together. Some of the trainings I've taken, one of the books we had was "Environmental Leadership Equals Essential Leadership." To me, they're all intertwined... |
|  | Logistics - facilitation/ teambuilding/ mediation is effective | 50 | Mentions the importance of facilitation and indicates what makes facilitation effective (or not effective) | ***Participant 3:*** *One of the things that I have done, at several different times, is I've actually hired a professional facilitator, for different kinds of meetings. That has taken some of the pressure off because they're not agency people. They really don't have a dog in the fight. They can just say, "Listen. We're here to respectfully talk." I've done it with public meetings, I've done it with meetings within, and I've even, in one case, brought in a trainer to train our entire office on teams and how to become an effective team. I think that is some of the same principles that you'll use...It took me 23 years, basically, to be in a position where I can go get that training and bring it to my office. I had to be the field manager or the district manager, in order to have the clout to pull that off and say, "I don't really care. I want those people in here, and I want the trainers for three or four days," and they did. Many of my team members who walked out of there were really like, "Wow! I wish I'd have had that 10 years ago." It was a significant cost, and not something that all managers perhaps might be committed to.* |
|  | Logistics - struggles to coordinate logistics/facilitate | 5 | Expresses struggles in coordinating logistics of meetings, or has a general negative attitude toward the facilitation process, as in “We don’t need to use facilitators” | ***Participant 7****: Yeah. Not a good technique and what I've seen employed at various levels and in different situations is the kind of group‑think model that says, "I'm a facilitator and we're here to hear from everybody, so let's all talk." Those are disasters. They never lead anywhere. No one's in charge. There have to be clear, defined roles. There has to be a common understanding of at what point a decision needs to be made, and it cannot degenerate into everybody having equal say. You just can't, because some of these meetings there's 20, 50 people in them. So the amount of time spent for everybody to voice what they think is quite frankly counterproductive. I can't permit a pit mine by consensus. There are well‑established technical studies that need to be done, procedures that need to be followed, policies that need to be implemented. To go into some collaborative effort with stakeholders, wildlife agencies, everybody to all try to reach some common understanding is a waste of time. The understanding has to be explained upfront. "This is what we're doing. This is how it needs to be done. Now, within this, here are some areas where we can work together to refine and to make some changes, but the overall shape of that is set." I think what fails is we go into these meetings assuming there aren't any shapes, we can all set the sideboards, and then they end up just being a monumental waste of time, they fizzle out, and everybody's more confused and further apart [laughs] at the end of that process than they were at the beginning.* |
|  | Logistics - coordinates logistics in response to stakeholder needs | 29 | Is responsive to stakeholder needs such as where/when to hold meetings to maximize attendance, and how many meetings to hold. Seeks to maximize ‘face time’ with stakeholders when possible. Includes adjusting his/her own schedule to attend meetings. | ***Participant 21****: "Don't miss your chance. Rather, talk to the folks. Rather to have it this day. Can more folks attend this day? Can we set up a praise line?" People need to be flexible and adaptable to do those situations. Also, I recognize times a day is important. If I had a stakeholder meeting at two in the afternoon, I wouldn't get anyone, because they're going to be at work. I need to have one of them in the evening when people are off work. That flexibility is really important.* |
|  | Outcomes - relational outcome is important | 41 | Relational outcomes, such as strengthening or building relationships with stakeholders, are seen as important. | ***Participant 20****: When I got this job, I came from a permitting job where I was one of the doers, to speak, pushing permits and producing work. I wondered to myself, with the constant stream of people and phone calls and meetings, how anyone got any work done. Then, somewhere, I realized this is the work. [laughs]* |
|  | Outcomes - substantive outcome is important | 137 | For example, collaboration is a means to an end of avoiding a lawsuit or collaboration leads to conservation of natural resources, or a means to an end of checking a box to say that you followed a collaborative process (met agency requirements in doing so). | ***Interviewer****: What metrics do you use to determine whether collaboration's successful? How do you know it when you see it?*  ***Participant 1:*** *We didn't get sued. [laughs] That's a good one, right? Because we're land managers and we get sued for everything.* |
|  | Relationships - relationship building | 45 | Works to develop relationships upfront before the need for collaboration arises. | ***Participant 2****: I would say another thing to focus on is to have food and drink. You need to have snacks when you have these meetings because that makes people really...That's the relationship building part of it. That's a real important part of any collaborative effort is to get that relationship. You can't buy treats to bring to these meeting, [inaudible 31:54] you have to make them and bring them all. You bring fresh made pumpkin bear, chocolate chip cookies or something. When you have a break, people are munching and people are comfortable and they talk more and that builds that relationship.* |
|  | Relationships - involving stakeholders throughout | 60 | Effort is made to establish relationships and involve stakeholders from the beginning of a project, make sure everyone’s voices are heard, everyone has a seat at the table from the start. Also, ensures the right people are invited to participate. Mentions the importance of “buy in”. | ***Participant 6****: Among the keys is having the folks you're collaborating with, for them to be vested, for them to have ownership of what's going on, for them to see how they fit in. This is not a relationship that's simply out of convenience, because we need to check the collaboration box. It's because they have the dog in the hunt. Frankly, that's even true with industry. They realize it's beneficial for them to work with us and our partners.* |