The relationship between carbon dioxide and agriculture in Ghana: a comparison of VECM and ARDL model

Samuel Asumadu-Sarkodie¹ · Phebe Asantewaa Owusu¹

Received: 6 December 2015 / Accepted: 4 February 2016
© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2016

Abstract In this paper, the relationship between carbon dioxide and agriculture in Ghana was investigated by comparing a Vector Error Correction Model (VECM) and Autoregressive and Distributed Lag (ARDL) Model. Ten study variables spanning from 1961 to 2012 were employed from the Food Agricultural Organization. Results from the study show that carbon dioxide emissions affect the percentage annual change of agricultural area, coarse grain production, cocoa bean production, fruit production, vegetable production, and the total livestock per hectare of the agricultural area. The vector error correction model and autoregressive distributed lag model show evidence of a causal relationship between carbon dioxide emissions and agriculture; however, the relationship decreases periodically which may die over-time. All the endogenous variables except total primary vegetable production lead to carbon dioxide emissions, which may be due to poor agricultural practices to meet the growing food demand in Ghana. The autoregressive distributed lag bounds test shows evidence of a long-run equilibrium relationship between the percentage annual change of agricultural area, cocoa bean production, total livestock per hectare of agricultural area, total pulses production, total primary vegetable production, and carbon dioxide emissions. It is important to end hunger and ensure people have access to safe and nutritious food, especially the poor, orphans, pregnant women, and children under-5 years in order to reduce maternal and infant

mortalities. Nevertheless, it is also important that the Government of Ghana institutes agricultural policies that focus on promoting a sustainable agriculture using environmental friendly agricultural practices. The study recommends an integration of climate change measures into Ghana's national strategies, policies and planning in order to strengthen the country's effort to achieving a sustainable environment.

Keywords Carbon dioxide · Agricultural emissions · Cointegration · VECM · ARDL · Ghana

JEL Classification Q54 · Q57

Acronyms		
AIC	Akaike Information Criterion	
ARDL	Autoregressive and Distributed Lag	
CHAL	% annual change (Agricultural area)	
COAGRPROD	Coarse Grain, Total + (Total) Production (Tonnes)	
COCUBE	Cocoa, beans Production (Tonnes)	
FPE	Final Prediction Error	
FRUPROD	Fruit excl Melons, Total + (Total) Production Tonnes	
HQ	Hannan-Quinn Information Criteria	
LIVEHEC	Livestock total per ha of agricultural area No/Ha	
LR	Sequential Likelihood-Ratio	
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals	
PULPROD	Pulses, Total + (Total) Production (Tonnes)	
RNTPROD	Roots and Tubers, Total + (Total) Production (Tonnes)	
SC	Schwarz Information Criterion	
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal	

Responsible editor: Marcus Schulz

✉ Samuel Asumadu-Sarkodie
asumadusarkodiesamuel@yahoo.com

¹ Orta Dogu Teknik Universitesi Kuzey Kibris Kampusu Guzelyurt, Guzelyurt, Turkey

83	VAR	Vector Autoregression
86	VECM	Vector Error Correction Model
88	VEGPROD	Vegetables Primary + (Total)
89		Production (Tonnes)

90 Abbreviations

93	Chi ²	Chi square
93	Coef.	Coefficient
96	cointEq	Cointegrated equation
98	df	Difference
100	Prob	Probability
103	Std. Err.	Standard error
104	Greek Letter	
106	π	Rank

109 Introduction

110 The growth rate of carbon dioxide has increased over the past
 111 36 years (1979–2014), “averaging about 1.4 ppm per year
 112 before 1995 and 2.0 ppm per year thereafter” (Earth System
 113 Research Laboratory 2015). The Sustainable Development
 114 Goal 13 focuses on actions that help mitigate climate change
 115 and its impact. There is an increasing global effort towards
 116 climate change mitigation since the emergence of the
 117 Millennium Development Goals (Asumadu-Sarkodie and
 118 Owusu 2016a, b, c). Nonetheless, approaches toward reducing
 119 greenhouse gas effect through emission-reduction policies
 120 (Busch et al. 2012) have been skewed toward the energy and
 121 industrial sector. Burney et al. (2010) argues that global agri-
 122 cultural output has increased with increasing population since
 123 the middle of the twentieth century. A doubling in global food
 124 demand (Tilman et al. 2002) to meet the rapidly growing
 125 population poses threat to agricultural and environmental sus-
 126 tainability. Agriculture has been identified as one of the main
 127 sources of greenhouse gas emissions (GHG) (Burney et al.
 128 2010) due to unsustainable agricultural practices in order to
 129 boost productivity, which leads to food security.

130 Agriculture is one of the major drivers in Ghana’s growing
 131 economy. With regards to agricultural GDP by sectors as at
 132 2010, crop production accounts for 66.2 %, forestry accounts
 133 for 12.2 %, fisheries account for 7.3 %, cocoa production
 134 accounts for 8.2 %, and livestock production accounts for
 135 6.1 %, respectively (Ministry of Food and Agriculture). Out
 136 of 3,396,000 ha of the area designated for starchy and cereal
 137 staple production, the largest area of about 992,000 ha is used
 138 for maize production followed by cassava production of about
 139 875,000 ha, yam production of about 385,000 ha, plantain
 140 production of about 328,000 ha, sorghum production of about
 141 253,000 ha, cocoyam/taro production of about 205,000 ha,
 142 rice production of about 181,000 ha, and millet production
 143 of about 177,000 ha, respectively (Ministry of Food and
 144 Agriculture). With regards to industrial crop production, co-
 145 coa production occupies the largest area of about 1,600,

000 ha, followed by oil palm production of about 360, 146
 000 ha, tomato production of about 50,000 ha, seed cotton 147
 production of about 20,000 ha, other vegetables account for 148
 20,000 ha, pineapple accounts for 328,000 ha, and other (co- 149
 conut, banana, kola, rubber, tobacco, etc.). Production account 150
 for 2,000,000 ha, summing up to 4,060,000 ha (Ministry of 151
 Food and Agriculture). 152

153 In the same vein, livestock production has been increasing 153
 from 1999 to 2010. Cattle production rose from 1,288,000 154
 heads to 1,454,000 heads, sheep production rose from 2,658, 155
 000 heads to 3,779,000 heads, goat production rose from 2, 156
 931,000 heads to 4,855,000 heads, pig production rose from 157
 332,000 heads to 536,000 heads, and poultry production rose 158
 from 18,810,000 birds to 43,320,000 birds, respectively. 159
 However, annual fish production has decreased from 452, 160
 900 to 415,436 Mt. (Ministry of Food and Agriculture). At 161
 first sight, Ghana’s food and agricultural portfolio seem ap- 162
 preciable due to increasing food production to meet a growing 163
 Ghanaian population to achieve food security. To the best of 164
 our knowledge, the causal nexus between food production and 165
 carbon dioxide emissions are yet to be assessed. 166

167 The remainder of the study is sectioned into Literature 167
 Review, Methodology, Results and Discussion, Conclusion 168
 and Policy Recommendations. 169

Literature review 170

171 A vast number of scientific studies have analyzed the relation- 171
 ship between agriculture production and traces of gas such as 172
 follows: carbon dioxide (CO₂), nitric oxide (NO), nitrous ox- 173
 ide (N₂O), ammonia (NH₃), and methane (CH₄). Borah and 174
 Baruah (2015) investigated the nitrous oxide (N₂O) emissions 175
 from wheat production by employing an estimation method to 176
 identify the physiological and anatomical factors of the wheat 177
 plant that contribute to the variations in nitrous oxide (N₂O) 178
 emissions. Their study concluded that the variations in nitrous 179
 oxide (N₂O) emissions were due to the genetic differences in 180
 the wheat genotype. Liu et al. (2015) analyzed the relationship 181
 between greenhouse gas emissions and straw management 182
 from mono-rice cultivation system by considering the soil 183
 quality and crop productivity. Their study concluded that 184
 combining rice straw mulching and green manuring was 185
 effective in stabilizing greenhouse gas emissions and soil 186
 health. Hussain et al. (2015) analyzed the effects of crop man- 187
 agement practices on greenhouse gas emissions in rice fields 188
 by employing a meta-analysis. Their study concluded that 189
 modifying tillage permutations, managing organic and 190
 fertilizer, and selecting crop regimes can mitigate 191
 greenhouse gas emissions. Bakhtiari et al. (2015) investigated 192
 the greenhouse gas emissions and the energy balance for saf- 193
 fron using Cobb-Douglas production function in EViews 7 194

software. Their study concluded that the cultivation of saffron emits 2325.5 kg CO₂eq. ha⁻¹ greenhouse gas emissions.

Roth et al. (2014) investigated methane (CH₄) and nitrous oxide (N₂O) emissions from pig farming under tropical climate. They concluded that N₂O emissions were related to nitrate composition while CH₄ emissions depended on moisture. Hagemann et al. (2012) analyzed the greenhouse gas emissions from milk production by using the standard regression analysis. Their study concluded that the estimation of contribution of milk production towards greenhouse gas emissions was uncertain based on the choice of the estimate and the method employed in assessing emissions at the individual level of the animal.

Our study is related with Li et al. (2014) who analyzed the agricultural CO₂ emissions in China from 1994 to 2011 by using the logarithmic mean divisa index as a decomposition technique. They concluded that economic development contributed immensely towards CO₂ emissions. Nonetheless, their dataset employed is limited to make a general conclusion regarding the said topic. Our study employs 9 variables and 52 observations using the Vector Error Correction Model (VECM) and Autoregressive and Distributed Lag (ARDL) model as econometric techniques.

In the area of multivariate causal relationship, a number of studies have investigated the causal relationship between carbon dioxide emissions, energy consumption, population, gross domestic product (GDP), etc. For example, Lozano and Gutiérrez (2008) analyzed the causal relationship between GDP, carbon dioxide, energy consumption, and population using a non-parametric approach. Their proposed model was applicable to USA. Huang et al. (2008) analyzed the causal relation between energy consumption and GDP for 82 countries using the generalized method of moments which they found no evidence between energy consumption and GDP. Zhang and Cheng (2009) analyzed the Granger causality between carbon dioxide, economic growth, population, and energy consumption. In their study, neither carbon dioxide emissions nor energy consumption leads to economic growth. Soytaş and Sari (2009) analyzed the relationship between carbon dioxide emissions, energy consumption, and economic growth using the long run Granger causality test. They concluded that carbon dioxide emissions Granger-cause energy consumption, but however not valid in the reverse. Adom and Bekoe (2012) forecasted the 2020 electrical energy requirement for Ghana by employing the ARDL and Partial adjustment model (PAM). Their study concluded that domestic electricity consumption is mainly explained by the income factor in Ghana.

Our study methodology is related with Farhani and Ozturk (2015) who studied the long-run causal nexus between carbon dioxide emissions, real GDP, urbanization, energy consumption, trade openness, and financial development in Tunisia by using the ARDL bound testing method and the error

correction method. Their study concluded that real GDP has a monotonic relationship with carbon dioxide, which rejected the validity of the environmental Kuznets curve hypothesis.

Nevertheless, the causal relationship between carbon dioxide emissions and agriculture is sporadic and limited especially in developing countries. Developing countries like Ghana are mostly ignored in the debate on mitigating carbon dioxide emissions ever since the United Nations framework convention on climate change (UNFCCC) instituted the Kyoto protocol. Nonetheless, Ghana acceded to the Kyoto Protocol in November 2002 and has been listed in non-Annex 1 countries that can only contribute in the clean development mechanism as her contribution to reducing emission levels of her greenhouse gases (UNTC). Ghana as a growing economy from lower-middle-income to a middle-income-economy has suffered many drawbacks in the field of health (Asumadu-Sarkodie and Owusu 2015), water management (Asumadu-Sarkodie et al. 2015a, b), energy management (Asumadu-Sarkodie and Owusu 2016a, b), etc. One reason associated with the drawbacks is a limited scientific research in the aforementioned areas to provide local and private investors with the required support to make decisive choices toward their investment in Ghana. Attempts to unveil the developmental issues in Ghana within the scientific arena are sporadic and limited. Therefore, a multidisciplinary approach that tackles the core issues in Ghana in the scientific space would boost nation building. Ghana's contribution to reducing carbon dioxide emissions as established in the MDGs and SDG (13) is yet to be assessed.

As our contribution to existing literature, we investigate the relationship between carbon dioxide and agriculture in Ghana by comparing VECM and ARDL which are different and absent from the literature listed in the study. Significantly, the study will increase the awareness of sustainable development in developing countries and serve as a reference tool for integrating climate change measures into agricultural policies, practices, and planning by the Government of Ghana.

Methodology

The study investigates the relationship between carbon dioxide and agriculture in Ghana by comparing the VECM and ARDL model using EViews 7 software for the computations. A time series data spanning from 1961 to 2012 were employed from Food Agriculture Organization (FAO). Ten study variables were used in the study, which include the following: CO₂—carbon dioxide emissions (kt), LIVEHEC—total livestock per hectare of agricultural area (No/Ha), CHAL—annual change of agricultural area (%), RNTPROD—total roots and tubers production (tons), VEGPROD—total primary vegetables production (tons), PULPROD—total pulses production (tons), FRUPROD—total fruit production excluding melons (tons), COAGRPROD—total coarse grain production (tons), and

298 COCOBE—cocoa beans production (tons). The selection of
299 the variables was based on their major constitution of Ghana's
300 agricultural sector.

A linear function can be used to express the relationship
between carbon dioxide and agriculture in Ghana, showed in
Eq. (1):

$$CO2_t = f(CHAL_t, COAGRPROD_t, COCOBE_t, FRUPROD_t, LIVEHEC_t, PULPROD_t, RNTPROD_t, VEGPROD_t) \quad (1)$$

308
309
310 The empirical specifications for the model can be quantified as:

$$\begin{aligned} CO2_t = & \beta_0 + \beta_1 CHAL_t + \beta_2 COAGRPROD_t \\ & + \beta_3 COCOBE_t + \beta_4 FRUPROD_t \\ & + \beta_5 LIVEHEC_t + \beta_6 PULPROD_t \\ & + \beta_7 RNTPROD_t + \beta_8 VEGPROD_t + \varepsilon_t \end{aligned} \quad (2)$$

315
316 Where $CO2_t$ is the dependent variable while $CHAL_t$,
317 $COAGRPROD_t$, $COCOBE_t$, $FRUPROD_t$, $LIVEHEC_t$,
318 $PULPROD_t$, $RNTPROD_t$, and $VEGPROD_t$ are the explanato-
319 ry variables in year t , ε_t is the error term and $\beta_0, \beta_1, \beta_2, \beta_3, \beta_4$,
320 $\beta_5, \beta_6, \beta_7$, and β_8 are the elasticities to be estimated.

321 Vector autogression (VAR) model is first considered in the
322 study following the work of Chang (2010), Fei et al. (2011),
323 Gul et al. (2015), Soytaş and Sari (2009), and Zhang and
324 Cheng (2009), which can be expressed as:

$$Y_t = \delta + A_1 Y_{t-1} + \dots + A_p Y_{t-p} + \varepsilon_t \quad (3)$$

327
328 The corresponding VEC model can be expressed as:

$$\begin{aligned} \Delta y_t = & \beta_{y_0} + \beta_{y_1} \Delta y_{t-1} + \dots + \beta_{y_p} \Delta y_{t-p} + \gamma_{y_1} \Delta x_{t-1} \\ & + \dots + \gamma_{y_p} \Delta x_{t-p} - \lambda_y (y_{t-1} - \alpha_0 - \alpha_1 x_{t-1}) + v_t^y \end{aligned} \quad (4)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \Delta x_t = & \beta_{x_0} + \beta_{x_1} \Delta y_{t-1} + \dots + \beta_{x_p} \Delta y_{t-p} + \gamma_{x_1} \Delta x_{t-1} \\ & + \dots + \gamma_{x_p} \Delta x_{t-p} - \lambda_x (x_{t-1} - \alpha_0 - \alpha_1 y_{t-1}) + v_t^x \end{aligned} \quad (5)$$

Where $y_t = \alpha_0 + \alpha_1 x_t$ is the long-run cointegrating relation
existing between two variables of interest and, λ_y and λ_x are
the error correction parameters measuring the reaction of y and
 x towards the deviations from long-run equilibrium.

Engle-Granger (Engle and Granger 1987), Johansen's
method (Johansen 1995), or single equation methods like
Dynamic Ordinary Least Squares (DOLS), Fully-Modified
Ordinary Least Squares (FMOLS), and VEC models have
been used in econometrics to examine the long run and
cointegration between variables, which as a requirement, all
variables must be I(1) or a prior knowledge and specification
requirement of variables are I(0) and I(1). Nevertheless,
Pesaran and Shin (1998) showed that cointegration among
variables can be estimated as an ARDL model with the vari-
ables in cointegration at either I(0) or I(1) without pre-
specification of variables which are either I(0) or I(1).
Moreover, Pesaran and Shin (1998) argue that ARDL model
can have different number of lag terms without the require-
ment of symmetry lag lengths like other cointegration estima-
tion methods. The study employs the ARDL method of
cointegration to estimate long-run equilibrium relationship be-
tween $CO2$ and the independent variables ($CHAL$,
 $COAGRPROD$, $COCOBE$, $FRUPROD$, $LIVEHEC$,
 $PULPROD$, $RNTPROD$, and $VEGPROD$). Following the
work of Adom and Bekoe (2012), Fuinhas and Marques
(2012), Kankal et al. (2011), and Ozturk and Acaravci
(2011), ARDL Cointegration regression form of ARDL model
can be expressed as:

$$\begin{aligned} \Delta CO2_t = & \alpha_0 + \delta_1 CO2_{t-1} + \delta_2 CHAL_{t-1} + \delta_3 COAGRPROD_{t-1} + \delta_4 COCOBE_{t-1} + \delta_5 FRUPROD_{t-1} + \delta_6 LIVEHEC_{t-1} \\ & + \delta_7 PULPROD_{t-1} + \delta_8 RNTPROD_{t-1} + \delta_9 VEGPROD_{t-1} + \sum_{i=1}^p \beta_{1j} \Delta CO2_{t-i} \\ & + \sum_{i=0}^p \beta_{2j} \Delta CHAL_{t-i} + \sum_{i=0}^p \beta_{3j} \Delta COAGRPROD_{t-i} + \sum_{i=0}^p \beta_{4j} \Delta COCOBE_{t-i} \\ & + \sum_{i=0}^p \beta_{5j} \Delta FRUPROD_{t-i} + \sum_{i=0}^p \beta_{6j} \Delta LIVEHEC_{t-i} + \sum_{i=0}^p \beta_{7j} \Delta PULPROD_{t-i} \\ & + \sum_{i=0}^p \beta_{8j} \Delta RNTPROD_{t-i} + \sum_{i=0}^p \beta_{9j} \Delta VEGPROD_{t-i} + \varepsilon_{1t} \end{aligned} \quad (6)$$

367
368
369 Where α is the intercept, p is the lag order, ε_t is the error
372 term, and Δ is the first difference operator. In order to test the
373 long-run equilibrium relationship between $CO2$, $CHAL$,

$COAGRPROD$, $COCOBE$, $FRUPROD$, $LIVEHEC$,
 $PULPROD$, $RNTPROD$, and $VEGPROD$, F tests are used in
the study. The null hypothesis of no cointegration between

CO₂, CHAL, COAGRAPHOD, COCOBE, FRUPROD, LIVEHEC, PULPROD, RNTPROD, and VEGPROD is $H_0: \delta_1 = \delta_2 = \delta_3 = \delta_4 = \delta_5 = \delta_6 = \delta_7 = \delta_8 = \delta_9 = 0$ against the alternative hypothesis $H_1: \delta_1 \neq \delta_2 \neq \delta_3 \neq \delta_4 \neq \delta_5 \neq \delta_6 \neq \delta_7 \neq \delta_8 \neq \delta_9 \neq 0$.

According to Pesaran et al. (2001), the computed F -statistic is compared with the first and the second critical values known as the lower bound and upper bound, respectively. If the computed F -statistic goes above the upper bound, the null hypothesis of no cointegration between CO₂, CHAL, COAGRAPHOD, COCOBE, FRUPROD, LIVEHEC, PULPROD, RNTPROD, and VEGPROD is rejected; otherwise, if it goes less the lower bound, the null hypothesis of no cointegration between CO₂, CHAL, COAGRAPHOD, COCOBE, FRUPROD, LIVEHEC, PULPROD, RNTPROD, and VEGPROD cannot be rejected. Nevertheless, if F -statistic lies between the lower and the upper bounds, the null hypothesis of no cointegration CO₂, CHAL, COAGRAPHOD, COCOBE, FRUPROD, LIVEHEC, PULPROD, RNTPROD, and VEGPROD become inconclusive, which can either be clarified through Johansen's test of cointegration (Johansen 1995) or by checking the constancy of the cointegration space using the cumulative sum recursive residuals and the cumulative of square of recursive residuals, respectively (Brown et al. 1975).

Descriptive analysis

Table 1 presents the descriptive analysis of 52 observations from the time series variables. All the variables exhibit a long-right-tail (positive skewness) with LIVEHEC having the longest right tail. While CO₂, RNTPROD, COAGRAPHOD, and VEGPROD exhibit platykurtic distribution, the other variables exhibit leptokurtic distribution of the normal. Jarque-Bera test statistic which operates under the null hypothesis that series are normally distributed shows that PULPROD, COAGRAPHOD, and VEGPROD are normally distributed while the remaining variables reject the null hypothesis at 5 % p value. All the independent variables show a positive monotonic relationship with CO₂ (dependent variable); however, the strength of association is stronger between CO₂ and RNTPROD as ρ approaches 1. Figure 1 shows the trend of endogenous variables. Almost all the endogenous variables increases periodically; however, CHAL exhibits a quick rise and fall scenario (see Fig. 1). The increasing population in Ghana has led to increasing demand of agricultural production, which is also time dependent.

Unit root test

Performing unit root test is vital in minimizing spurious regression since it ensures that variables used in a regression are stationary by differencing them and estimating the equation of interest through the stationary processes (Mahadeva and Robinson 2004). Group unit root test using Levin, Lin

and Chu test (Levin et al. 2002), Breitung t -stat (Breitung 1999), Im, Pesaran and Shin W -stat (Im et al. 2003), Augmented Dickey Fuller—Fisher Chi-square, and Phillips-Perron—Fisher Chi-square methods (Choi 2001; Hadri 2000; Maddala and Wu 1999) assumes a common and individual unit root process as a null hypothesis of a unit root. However, we fail to accept the null hypothesis at level based on 5 % p value. The model proposed is stationary at level, but non-stationary at first differences (Table 2).

Lag selection for vector error correction model

After performing unit root tests, the next step is to identify the optimal lag for the VEC model. Vector autoregression (VAR) lag order selection criteria are used to select the optimal lag to the test of cointegration in the research analysis. Table 3 shows VAR Lag order selection criteria. Four lags are employed in this multivariate model because the sequential modified likelihood-ratio test statistic (LR), final prediction error (FPE), Akaike information criterion (AIC), Schwarz information criterion (SC) and Hannan-Quinn information criteria (HQ) select 4 as the optimal lag as indicated by “*” in Table 3.

Results and discussion

In this section, empirical evidence and discussions of the major findings are outlined.

Cointegration test and vector error correction model

Using the optimal lag selected by information criteria tests, Johansen's method of cointegration is estimated. Table 4 presents the summary of Johansen cointegration test (Johansen 1995) by max-eigenvalue and trace methods. Based on 5 % significance in the results shown in Table 4, we strongly reject the null hypothesis of no cointegration and fail to reject the null hypothesis of at most six cointegrating equations. Thus, we accept the null hypothesis that there are six cointegrating equations in the multivariate model.

Using the optimal lag and the number of cointegrating equations, the study estimates the vector error correction model. Table 5 shows the long-run multivariate causality of the error correction model. Findings from the analysis show that no long-run multivariate causality exists between CO₂ and the other endogenous variables. However, short-run causality exists running from COCOBE, FRUPROD, LIVEHEC, and PULPROD to CO₂. However, since there was no evidence of long-run multivariate causality, it is realistic to ascertain the direction of the causal relationships between CO₂ and the other endogenous variables using Granger causality test (Granger 1988).

Table 6 presents a summary of a pairwise Granger causality Wald test. The null hypothesis that CHAL does not Granger

t1.1 **Table 1** Descriptive statistical analysis

t1.2	Statistic	CO2	CHAL	COAGRPROD	COCUBE	FRUPROD	LIVEHEC	PULPROD	RNTPROD	VEGPROD
t1.3	Mean	4488	0.6115	1,085,025	404,813	1,838,997	1.6552	14,541	8,268,879	424,301
t1.4	Median	3335	0.5900	908,850	393,446	1,308,140	1.3400	14,500	4,666,045	398,172
t1.5	Maximum	10,103	2.9500	2,415,110	879,348	4,603,330	4.300	25,000	22,591,600	827,863
t1.6	Minimum	1346	0.0000	356,328	166,700	704,000	0.7100	5000	2,899,000	160,000
t1.7	Std. Dev.	2676	0.7149	590,330	169,966	1,178,798	0.8528	4604	6,061,616	185,414
t1.8	Skewness	0.778	1.1426	0.5766	0.9200	1.1716	1.5396	0.0356	0.8804	0.3470
t1.9	Kurtosis	2.376	4.0237	2.2591	3.175	3.1163	4.6153	3.0153	2.4468	2.1164
t1.10	Jarque-Bera	6.089	13.585	4.0707	7.4013	11.9256	26.1969	0.0115	7.3808	2.7354
t1.11	Probability	0.048*	0.0011*	0.1306	0.0247*	0.0026*	0.0001*	0.9943	0.025*	0.2547
t1.12	Correlation									
t1.13	CO2	1								
t1.14	CHAL	0.5302	1							
t1.15	COAGRPROD	0.9289	0.5219	1						
t1.16	COCUBE	0.6565	0.1578	0.5961	1					
t1.17	FRUPROD	0.9577	0.4239	0.9167	0.7631	1				
t1.18	LIVEHEC	0.9163	0.3318	0.8568	0.7791	0.9592	1			
t1.19	PULPROD	0.6990	0.2136	0.7050	0.4151	0.7294	0.7456	1		
t1.20	RNTPROD	0.9659	0.4696	0.9565	0.7206	0.9644	0.9220	0.6557	1	
t1.21	VEGPROD	0.7941	0.6111	0.8265	0.4636	0.7413	0.6813	0.5891	0.7824	1

*Rejection of the null hypothesis at 5 % *p* value

Fig. 1 Trend of endogenous variables

t2.1 **Table 2** Unit root testing

t2.2	Level indivi. intercept		Unit test method			
t2.3	Method	Levin, Lin and Chu t	Breitung t-stat	Im, Pesaran and Shin W-stat	ADF—Fisher Chi-square	PP—Fisher Chi-square
t2.4	Statistic	7.52987	—	6.36604	6.95122	17.7264
t2.5	Prob.**	0.9994	—	1.0000	0.9905	0.4738
t2.6	Level indivi. intercept and trend					
t2.7	Statistic	3.24334	4.1874	3.21326	11.7706	34.7347
t2.8	Prob.**	0.9994	0.9994	0.9993	0.8589	0.0102
t2.9	1st diff indivi. intercept					
t2.10	Statistic	−9.0765	—	−13.4168	193.944	315.553
t2.11	Prob.**	0.0000	—	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000
t2.12	1st diff indivi. intercept and trend					
t2.13	Statistic	−10.605	−4.94109	−13.7597	183.171	853.607
t2.14	Prob.**	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000	0.0000

**Probabilities for Fisher tests are computed using an asymptotic Chi-square distribution. All other tests assume asymptotic normality. The null hypothesis is rejected at 5 % *p* value

cause CO₂, COAGRPROD does not Granger cause CO₂, ARDL cointegration test, long-run and model selection 482
COCOBE does not Granger cause CO₂, FRUPROD does 483
not Granger cause CO₂, LIVEHEC does not Granger cause 484
CO₂, PULPROD does not Granger cause CO₂, RNTPROD 485
does not Granger cause CO₂ is rejected at the 5 % significance 486
level. In other words, only VEGPROD does not Granger 487
cause CO₂ emissions. 488
Another evidence from the analysis shows that CO₂ emis- 489
sions Granger cause CHAL, COAGRPROD, COCOBE, 490
FRUPROD, LIVEHEC, and VEGPROD (see Table 6).

Cointeq = CO2− (1598.7198 × CHAL + 0.0013 × COAGRPROD + 0.0074 × COCOBE−0.0003
× FRUPROD−788.5518 × LIVEHEC + 0.2659 × PULPROD + 0.0003 × RNTPROD
−0.0024 × VEGPROD−3524.0628)

(7)

Table 7 presents a summary of ARDL cointegration and level, the null hypothesis of no existence of cointegration is 501
long-run coefficient estimation. Based on 5 % significance rejected. 502

t3.1 **Table 3** Lag order selection
t3.2 criteria

t3.3	Lag	LogL	LR	FPE	AIC	SC	HQ
t3.4	0	−4217.62		2.46E + 65	176.1091	176.4599	176.2417
t3.5	1	−3917.85	474.6252	2.86E + 61	166.9939	170.5024	168.3198
t3.6	2	−3835.17	99.90504	3.81E + 61	166.9239	173.5901	169.4431
t3.7	3	−3701.68	111.2473	1.29E + 61	164.7366	174.5604	168.449
	4	−3426.2	126.2595*	7.93E + 58*	156.6334*	169.6149*	161.5391*

LR sequential modified LR test statistic (each test at 5 % level), FPE final prediction error, AIC Akaike informa-
tion criterion, SC Schwarz information criterion, HQ Hannan-Quinn information criterion

*Indicates lag order selected by the criterion

t4.1 **Table 4** Summary of Johansen co-integrated test by max-eigenvalue and trace methods

t4.2	No. of CE(s)	Eigenvalue	Trace statistic	Critical value	Prob.**	Eigenvalue	Max-eigen statistic	Critical value	Prob.**
t4.3	None	0.9952	642.1057	197.3709	0.0001*	0.9952	256.4677	58.4335	0.0000*
t4.4	At most 1	0.9390	385.6380	159.5297	0.0000*	0.9390	134.2252	52.3626	0.0000*
t4.5	At most 2	0.8590	251.4128	125.6154	0.0000*	0.8590	94.0378	46.2314	0.0000*
t4.6	At most 3	0.7570	157.3750	95.7537	0.0000*	0.7570	67.9021	40.0776	0.0000*
t4.7	At most 4	0.5229	89.4729	69.8189	0.0006*	0.5229	35.5169	33.8769	0.0316*
t4.8	At most 5	0.4245	53.9560	47.8561	0.0120*	0.4245	26.5234	27.5843	0.0679
t4.9	At most 6	0.2742	27.4326	29.7971	0.0915	0.2742	15.3817	21.1316	0.2630
t4.10	At most 7	0.2220	12.0509	15.4947	0.1545	0.2220	12.0506	14.2646	0.1088
t4.11	At most 8	0.0000	0.0003	3.8415	0.9881	0.0000	0.0003	3.8415	0.9881

Trace test indicates six cointegrating eqn(s) at the 0.05 level while max-eigenvalue test indicates five cointegrating eqn(s) at the 0.05 level
*Denotes rejection of the hypothesis at the 0.05 level; **MacKinnon-Haug-Michelis (1999) *p* values

With the existence of cointegration, the next step is to select the optimal model for the long-run equilibrium relationship estimation. In Fig. 2, the Akaike information criterion model selection is given. Akaike information criterion was used to select the best model with the specification: ARDL (4, 4, 3, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4). From ARDL (4, 4, 3, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4, 4) model, the long-run equilibrium relationships were estimated using ARDL bounds test. ARDL bounds test for long-run estimation is presented in Table 8. The bounds cointegration test shows that the estimated *F*-statistic lies above the upper bound at 10, 5, and 2.5 % significance levels. Based on 5 % significance level, the null hypothesis of no long-run equilibrium relationship between variables is rejected.

Diagnostic test for VECM and ARDL model

In order to avoid misleading statistical inferences, the study verified and validated the model through diagnostic and stability checks. VECM was subjected to several diagnostic tests as presented in Table 10. VEC Residual Serial Correlation was tested using Lagrange-multiplier test based on Null Hypothesis: no serial correlation at lag order *h*. Results from the test shows that the null hypothesis cannot be rejected at the 5 % significance level, meaning that no serial correlation exists at lag order *h*. VEC Residual Normality was tested using Jarque-Bera test based on Null Hypothesis: residuals are multivariate normal. Results from the test shows that the null hypothesis cannot be rejected at the 5 % significance level, meaning that residuals are multivariate normally distributed.

In the same vein, ARDL was subjected to several diagnostic tests as presented in Table 9. Results from the test shows that the null hypothesis cannot be rejected at the 5 % significance level, meaning that no autocorrelation at lag order exists in the model (Breusch-Pagan-Godfrey Test), the equations are in their correct functional form (Ramsey RESET Test), no

serial correlation exists at lag order *h* in the model (Lagrange-multiplier test), and residuals are multivariate normally distributed (Jarque-Bera test).

Robustness of VECM and ARDL model

As mentioned, checking the stability of the model is also beneficial before making statistical inferences. Figure 3 shows the roots characteristic polynomial. The root characteristics polynomial is used to check the stability of the short run causality among endogenous variables in VECM (Table 10). VEC specification imposes one unit root and VAR stability condition check does not present a root outside the unit circle (the eigenvalues of the respective matrix are exactly one or less) besides the first unit root of 1. Therefore, since the model satisfies VAR stability conditions, the VEC model is acceptable in a statistical sense to make inferences.

Figure 4 shows the CUSUM of Squares, CUSUM, and Recursive Residuals tests for the parameter instability from ARDL model. The CUSUM of Squares, CUSUM, and Recursive Residuals tests are used to ascertain the parameter instability of the equation employed in the ARDL model. Since the plots in the CUSUM of Squares, CUSUM, and Recursive Residuals tests lie within the 5 % significance level or ± 2 S.E, the parameter of the equation is stable enough to estimate the long-run and short-run causality in the study.

Conclusion and policy recommendation

In this paper, the relationship between carbon dioxide and agriculture was investigated in Ghana by comparing a VECM and ARDL model using a time series data spanning from 1961 to 2012. Ten variables that constitute the majority of Ghana's agricultural sector were used in the study, which include the following: livestock, annual change of agricultural area, roots and tubers, total primary vegetable production,

t5.1 **Table 5** Long-run multivariate causality of the error correction model

t5.2	Error correction	D(CO2)	D(CHAL)	D(COAGRPROD)	D(COCUBE)	D(FRUPROD)	D(LIVEHEC)	D(PULPROD)	D(RNTPROD)	D(VEGPROD)
t5.3	CointEq1	−0.4393	0.0004	67.2037	−62.1631	323.0504	−0.0002	4.8425	371.3803	12.4760
t5.4	Std. error	−0.3774	−0.0005	−186.7290	−39.8512	−84.7524	−0.0001	−1.5137	−1148	−61.5081
t5.5	<i>t</i> -statistic	−1.1640	0.8095	0.3599	−1.5599	3.8117	−2.3233	3.1991	0.3233	0.2028
t5.6	<i>P</i> > <i>z</i>	0.2639	0.4318	0.7243	0.1411	0.0019*	0.0357*	0.0064*	0.7512	0.8422
t5.7	CointEq2	663	−0.9895	−42355	−110871	−348899	−0.0905	−6942	5048	−13,014
t5.8	Std. error	−419	−0.5867	−207,596	−44,304	−94,223	−0.0716	−1682	−1,276,990	−68,381
t5.9	<i>t</i> -statistic	1.5809	−1.6865	−0.2040	−2.5025	−3.7029	−1.2652	−4.1258	0.0040	−0.1903
t5.10	<i>P</i> > <i>z</i>	0.1362	0.1138	0.8413	0.0253*	0.0024*	0.2265	0.0010*	0.9969	0.8518
t5.11	CointEq3	0.0038	0.0000	−0.4123	−0.8350	−1.2704	0.0000	−0.0097	−0.1195	0.3115
t5.12	Std. error	−0.0020	0.0000	−1.0062	−0.2147	−0.4567	0.0000	−0.0082	−6.1892	−0.3314
t5.13	<i>t</i> -statistic	1.8547	1.9831	−0.4098	−3.8885	−2.7818	0.4503	−1.1923	−0.0193	0.9399
t5.14	<i>P</i> > <i>z</i>	0.0848	0.0673	0.6881	0.0016*	0.0147*	0.6594	0.2530	0.9849	0.3632
t5.15	CointEq4	0.0054	0.0000	−0.7888	−1.3404	−0.7261	0.0000	−0.0495	5.7796	−0.2264
t5.16	Std. error	−0.0027	0.0000	−1.3211	−0.2819	−0.5996	0.0000	−0.0107	−8.1263	−0.4352
t5.17	<i>t</i> -statistic	2.0273	0.3219	−0.5971	−4.7542	−1.2110	0.6564	−4.6214	0.7112	−0.5203
t5.18	<i>P</i> > <i>z</i>	0.0621	0.7523	0.5600	0.0003*	0.2459	0.5222	0.0004*	0.4886	0.6110
t5.19	CointEq5	−0.0010	0.0000	−0.2833	0.0324	−0.4843	0.0000	0.0017	−1.5000	−0.0224
t5.20	Std. error	−0.0007	0.0000	−0.3674	−0.0784	−0.1667	0.0000	−0.0030	−2.2598	−0.1210
t5.21	<i>t</i> -statistic	−1.4003	−1.4355	−0.7713	0.4128	−2.9044	2.5050	0.5696	−0.6638	−0.1851
t5.22	<i>P</i> > <i>z</i>	0.1832	0.1731	0.4534	0.6860	0.0115*	0.0252*	0.5779	0.5176	0.8558
t5.23	CointEq6	102	1.0809	124300	37187	−166399	−0.2474	6841	−1,052,947	122,747
t5.24	Std. error	−715	−1.0005	−354,010	−75,551	−160,677	−0.1220	−2869	−2,177,630	−116,610
t5.25	<i>t</i> -statistic	0.1427	1.0804	0.3511	0.4922	−1.0356	−2.0269	2.3841	−0.4835	1.0526
t5.26	<i>P</i> > <i>z</i>	0.8886	0.2982	0.7307	0.6302	0.3179	0.0622	0.0318*	0.6362	0.3103

*Significant at 5 % *p* value

t6.1	Table 6 Summary of a pairwise Granger causality Wald tests				
t6.2	Dependent	Independent	chi2	df	Prob>chi2
t6.3	CO2	CHAL	14.2	4	0.0070*
t6.4	CO2	COAGRPROD	31.928	4	0.0000*
t6.5	CO2	COCOBE	20.687	4	0.0000*
t6.6	CO2	FRUPROD	11.074	4	0.0260*
t6.7	CO2	LIVEHEC	12.77	4	0.0120*
t6.8	CO2	PULPROD	6.0475	4	0.1960
t6.9	CO2	RNTPROD	1.0036	4	0.9090
t6.10	CO2	VEGPROD	19.303	4	0.0010*
t6.11	CO2	ALL	249.01	32	0.0000*
t6.12	CHAL	CO2	11.653	4	0.0200*
t6.13	CHAL	COAGRPROD	16.697	4	0.0020*
t6.14	CHAL	COCOBE	19.956	4	0.0010*
t6.15	CHAL	FRUPROD	19.879	4	0.0010*
t6.16	CHAL	LIVEHEC	34.616	4	0.0000*
t6.17	CHAL	PULPROD	40.507	4	0.0000*
t6.18	CHAL	RNTPROD	37.492	4	0.0000*
t6.19	CHAL	VEGPROD	7.9873	4	0.0920
t6.20	CHAL	ALL	190.13	32	0.0000*
t6.21	COAGRPROD	CO2	13.682	4	0.0080*
t6.22	COAGRPROD	CHAL	18.063	4	0.0010*
t6.23	COAGRPROD	COCOBE	9.8365	4	0.0430*
t6.24	COAGRPROD	FRUPROD	8.1717	4	0.0850*
t6.25	COAGRPROD	LIVEHEC	4.4001	4	0.3550
t6.26	COAGRPROD	PULPROD	17.37	4	0.0020*
t6.27	COAGRPROD	RNTPROD	14.329	4	0.0060*
t6.28	COAGRPROD	VEGPROD	17.235	4	0.0020*
t6.29	COAGRPROD	ALL	172.71	32	0.0000*
t6.30	COCOBE	CO2	24.612	4	0.0000*
t6.31	COCOBE	CHAL	47.742	4	0.0000*
t6.32	COCOBE	COAGRPROD	63.548	4	0.0000*
t6.33	COCOBE	FRUPROD	15.833	4	0.0030*
t6.34	COCOBE	LIVEHEC	6.703	4	0.1520
t6.35	COCOBE	PULPROD	8.4783	4	0.0760
t6.36	COCOBE	RNTPROD	77.069	4	0.0000*
t6.37	COCOBE	VEGPROD	81.14	4	0.0000*
t6.38	COCOBE	ALL	615.45	32	0.0000*
t6.39	FRUPROD	CO2	173.78	4	0.0000*
t6.40	FRUPROD	CHAL	70.633	4	0.0000*
t6.41	FRUPROD	COAGRPROD	30.054	4	0.0000*
t6.42	FRUPROD	COCOBE	42.614	4	0.0000*
t6.43	FRUPROD	LIVEHEC	49.571	4	0.0000*
t6.44	FRUPROD	PULPROD	43.923	4	0.0000*
t6.45	FRUPROD	RNTPROD	99.038	4	0.0000*
t6.46	FRUPROD	VEGPROD	50.463	4	0.0000*
t6.47	FRUPROD	ALL	711.79	32	0.0000*
t6.48	LIVEHEC	CO2	16.607	4	0.0020*
t6.49	LIVEHEC	CHAL	8.6783	4	0.0700*
t6.50	LIVEHEC	COAGRPROD	13.618	4	0.0090*
t6.51	LIVEHEC	COCOBE	6.8334	4	0.1450
t6.52	LIVEHEC	FRUPROD	62.244	4	0.0000*
t6.53	LIVEHEC	PULPROD	5.0669	4	0.2810

t6.54	Table 6 (continued)				
	Dependent	Independent	chi2	df	Prob>chi2
t6.55	LIVEHEC	RNTPROD	8.1877	4	0.0850
t6.56	LIVEHEC	VEGPROD	4.6244	4	0.3280
t6.57	LIVEHEC	ALL	262.21	32	0.0000*
t6.58	PULPROD	CO2	115	4	0.0000*
t6.59	PULPROD	CHAL	98.649	4	0.0000*
t6.60	PULPROD	COAGRPROD	14.282	4	0.0060*
t6.61	PULPROD	COCOBE	85.029	4	0.0000*
t6.62	PULPROD	FRUPROD	105.45	4	0.0000*
t6.63	PULPROD	LIVEHEC	112.85	4	0.0000*
t6.64	PULPROD	RNTPROD	35.836	4	0.0000*
t6.65	PULPROD	VEGPROD	54.826	4	0.0000*
t6.66	PULPROD	ALL	520.24	32	0.0000*
t6.67	RNTPROD	CO2	11.6	4	0.0210*
t6.68	RNTPROD	CHAL	9.6898	4	0.0460*
t6.69	RNTPROD	COAGRPROD	6.1751	4	0.1860
t6.70	RNTPROD	COCOBE	9.6749	4	0.0460*
t6.71	RNTPROD	FRUPROD	8.4719	4	0.0760
t6.72	RNTPROD	LIVEHEC	12.738	4	0.0130*
t6.73	RNTPROD	PULPROD	4.1052	4	0.3920
t6.74	RNTPROD	VEGPROD	9.3527	4	0.0530
t6.75	RNTPROD	ALL	90.531	32	0.0000*
t6.76	VEGPROD	CO2	3.5456	4	0.4710
t6.77	VEGPROD	CHAL	6.8709	4	0.1430
t6.78	VEGPROD	COAGRPROD	10.079	4	0.0390
t6.79	VEGPROD	COCOBE	19.122	4	0.0010*
t6.80	VEGPROD	FRUPROD	31.349	4	0.0000*
t6.81	VEGPROD	LIVEHEC	17.736	4	0.0010*
t6.82	VEGPROD	PULPROD	33.535	4	0.0000*
t6.83	VEGPROD	RNTPROD	16.259	4	0.0030*
t6.84	VEGPROD	ALL	230.75	32	0.0000*

*Denotes rejection of the hypothesis at 5 %

t7.1	Table 7 Summary of ARDL cointegration and long-run coefficient estimation				
t7.2	Variable	Coefficient	Std. error	t-statistic	Prob.
t7.3	CHAL	1598.719788	260.8435	6.129038	0.0036*
t7.4	COAGRPROD	0.001253	0.000968	1.294321	0.2652
t7.5	COCOBE	0.007401	0.001896	3.902878	0.0175*
t7.6	FRUPROD	-0.000338	0.000303	-1.11553	0.3271
t7.7	LIVEHEC	-788.551777	249.7341	-3.15757	0.0343*
t7.8	PULPROD	0.265884	0.038289	6.944175	0.0023*
t7.9	RNTPROD	0.000334	0.000121	2.758728	0.0509
t7.10	VEGPROD	-0.002386	0.000573	-4.16152	0.0141*
t7.11	C	-3524.062765	746.1006	-4.72331	0.0091*
t7.12	CointEq(-1)	-3.80061	1.105852	-3.43682	0.0264*

*Denotes rejection of the hypothesis at 5 %

Fig. 2 Akaike information criterion model selection

total pulses production, total fruit production excluding melons, total coarse grain production, and cocoa bean production.

Results from the study shows that carbon dioxide emissions affect the percentage annual change of agricultural area, coarse grain production, cocoa bean production, fruit production, vegetable production, and the total livestock per hectare of the agricultural area. It is widely assumed that atmospheric carbon dioxide will increase crop production; nevertheless, in Figs. 5 and 6, the majority of the cointegration relation in VECM and ARDL model shows that the relationship between carbon dioxide emissions and agriculture in Ghana decreases periodically which may die over-time. The evidence provided in study confirms a study by Chang (2013) whose analysis shows that Ghana has an excess carbon dioxide emissions of –67.97 million metric tons.

Moreover, all the time series variables (total livestock per hectare of agricultural area, annual change of Agricultural area, total roots and tuber production, total pulses production,

Table 8 Summary of ARDL bound testing

Test statistic	Value	k
F-statistic	4.08*	8
Critical value bounds		
Significance	I0 bound	I1 bound
10 %	1.95	3.06
5 %	2.22	3.39
2.50 %	2.48	3.7
1 %	2.79	4.1

*indicates statistical significance at the 5 % level

Table 9 Diagnostics of ARDL model

Heteroskedasticity Test: Breusch-Pagan-Godfrey			
F-statistic	0.8273	Prob. F(43,4)	0.6790
Obs*R-squared	43.1484	Prob. chi-square(43)	0.4650
Scaled explained SS	0.1863	Prob. chi-square(43)	1.0000
Ramsey RESET test			
	Value	df	Probability
t-statistic	0.5403	3	0.6265
F-statistic	0.292	(1, 3)	0.6265
Residual Serial Correlation LM Tests			
F-statistic	17.6452	Prob. F(2,2)	0.0536
Obs*R-squared	45.4256	Prob. chi-square(2)	0.0000
Jarque-Bera test			
Component	Jarque-Bera	df	Prob.
1	4.446118	2	0.1083
2	2.914486	2	0.2329
3	0.897849	2	0.6383
4	0.687153	2	0.7092
5	2.771376	2	0.2502
6	0.590204	2	0.7445
7	1.055934	2	0.5898
8	3.189843	2	0.2029
9	0.00901	2	0.9955

total fruit production excluding melons, total coarse grain production, and cocoa bean production) except total primary vegetables production lead to carbon dioxide emissions. This may be due to poor agricultural practices to meet the growing food demand in Ghana.

Inverse Roots of AR Characteristic Polynomial

Fig. 3 Checking the stability of VAR

Table 10 Diagnostics of VECM

t10.2	VEC Residual Serial Correlation LM tests		
t10.3	Lags	LM-Stat	Prob
t10.4	1	64.65506	0.4536
t10.5	2	59.54709	0.6345
t10.6	3	71.05257	0.2545
t10.7	4	62.60911	0.5258
t10.8	Jarque-Bera test		
t10.9	Component	Jarque-Bera	Prob.
t10.10	1	0.525101	0.7691
t10.11	2	0.906349	0.6356
t10.12	3	1.209573	0.5462
t10.13	4	0.86453	0.6490
t10.14	5	2.992064	0.2240
t10.15	6	0.410164	0.8146
t10.16	7	0.148349	0.9285
t10.17	8	0.142896	0.9310
t10.18	9	1.022088	0.5999

and total pulses production of carbon dioxide emissions. But in contrast to *no evidence* of long-run relationship with the VEC model, ARDL bounds test cointegration analysis shows evidence of a long-run equilibrium relationship between the percentage annual change of agricultural area, cocoa bean production, livestock total per hectare of agricultural area, total pulses production, total primary vegetable production, and carbon dioxide emissions. Nevertheless, since ARDL bound testing method of cointegration is superior to other modern econometric techniques in small sample size, the results from ARDL model is unbiased and can be accepted since it meets diagnostic and stability conditions. Based on the results from the ARDL model, the following policy recommendations are made:

- It is important to end hunger and ensure people have access to safe and nutritious food, especially the poor, orphans, pregnant women, and children under-5 years in order to reduce maternal and infant mortalities. Nevertheless, it is also important that the Government of Ghana institutes agricultural policies that focus on promoting a sustainable agriculture using environmental friendly agricultural practices.
- Increasing agricultural investment in Ghana through enhanced international cooperation will help reduce the use

VECM analysis provides evidence of a short-run causality running from cocoa bean production, total fruit production excluding melons, livestock total per hectare of agricultural area, annual change of Agricultural area,

Fig. 4 a CUSUM of squares; b CUSUM; and c recursive residuals tests for the parameter stability from ARDL model

Fig. 5 Cointegration relation of carbon dioxide and exogenous variables using VECM

Fig. 6 Cointegration relation of carbon dioxide and exogenous variables using ARDL

- of crude and indigenous agricultural methods that are detrimental to the ecosystem and agricultural productivity.
- There should be introduction of measures that ensure proper running of agricultural commodity markets and the timely access to agricultural output reserves in order to prevent extreme agricultural output price volatility.
- There should be an improvement in education, awareness-raising and institutional capacity building on early warning signs, climate change reduction, and adaptations.

Finally, the Government of Ghana should integrate climate change measures into the national strategies, policies, and planning in order to strengthen the country's effort to achieving a sustainable ecosystem. Future research should examine the percentage contribution of the causal relationship between carbon dioxide emissions and other agricultural commodities.

References

- Adom PK, Bekoe W (2012) Conditional dynamic forecast of electrical energy consumption requirements in Ghana by 2020: a comparison of ARDL and PAM. *Energy* 44:367–380
- Asumadu-Sarkodie S, Owusu PA (2015) Media impact on students' body image. *Int J Res Appl Sci Eng Technol* 3:460–469
- Asumadu-Sarkodie S, Owusu P (2016) Feasibility of biomass heating system in Middle East Technical University, Northern Cyprus campus cogent engineering doi:10.1080/23311916.2015.1134304
- Asumadu-Sarkodie S, Owusu PA (2016a) The potential and economic viability of solar photovoltaic in Ghana energy sources, part A: recovery, utilization, and environmental effects
- Asumadu-Sarkodie S, Owusu PA (2016b) The potential and economic viability of wind farm in Ghana energy sources, part A: recovery, utilization, and environmental effects
- Asumadu-Sarkodie S, Owusu PA, Jayaweera HM (2015a) Flood risk management in Ghana: a case study in Accra. *Adv Appl Sci Res* 6:196–201
- Asumadu-Sarkodie S, Owusu PA, Rufangura P (2015b) Impact analysis of flood in Accra, Ghana. *Adv Appl Sci Res* 6:53–78
- Bakhtiari AA, Hematian A, Sharifi A (2015) Energy analyses and greenhouse gas emissions assessment for saffron production cycle. *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int* 22:16184–16201. doi:10.1007/s11356-015-4843-6
- Borah L, Baruah KK (2015) Nitrous oxide emission and mitigation from wheat agriculture: association of physiological and anatomical characteristics of wheat genotypes. *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int*. doi:10.1007/s11356-015-5299-4
- Breitung J (1999) The local power of some unit root tests for panel data. Discussion papers, interdisciplinary research project 373: quantification and simulation of economic processes
- Brown RL, Durbin J, Evans JM (1975) Techniques for testing the constancy of regression relationships over time. *J R Stat Soc Ser B (Methodol)*:149–192
- Burney JA, Davis SJ, Lobell DB (2010) Greenhouse gas mitigation by agricultural intensification. *Proc Natl Acad Sci* 107:12052–12057
- Busch J et al (2012) Structuring economic incentives to reduce emissions from deforestation within Indonesia. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 109:1062–1067
- Chang C-C (2010) A multivariate causality test of carbon dioxide emissions, energy consumption and economic growth in China. *Appl Energy* 87:3533–3537
- Chang SJ (2013) Solving the problem of carbon dioxide emissions. *For Policy Econ* 35:92–97. doi:10.1016/j.forpol.2013.06.013
- Choi I (2001) Unit root tests for panel data. *J Int Money Financ* 20:249–272
- Earth System Research Laboratory (2015) The NOAA Annual Greenhouse Gas Index (AGGI). <http://www.esrl.noaa.gov/gmd/aggi/aggi.html>. Accessed Oct 24, 2015
- Engle RF, Granger CW (1987) Co-integration and error correction: representation, estimation, and testing *Econometrica*: J Econ Soci 251–276
- Farhani S, Ozturk I (2015) Causal relationship between CO₂ emissions, real GDP, energy consumption, financial development, trade openness, and urbanization in Tunisia. *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int* 22:15663–15676. doi:10.1007/s11356-015-4767-1
- Fei L, Dong S, Xue L, Liang Q, Yang W (2011) Energy consumption-economic growth relationship and carbon dioxide emissions in China. *Energ Policy* 39:568–574. doi:10.1016/j.enpol.2010.10.025
- Food Agriculture Organization FAO Statistical Yearbooks—World food and agriculture. <http://faostat3.fao.org/home/E>
- Fuinhas JA, Marques AC (2012) Energy consumption and economic growth nexus in Portugal, Italy, Greece, Spain and Turkey: an ARDL bounds test approach (1965–2009). *Energy Econ* 34:511–517. doi:10.1016/j.eneco.2011.10.003
- Granger CW (1988) Some recent development in a concept of causality. *J Econ* 39:199–211
- Gul S, Zou X, Hassan CH, Azam M, Zaman K (2015) Causal nexus between energy consumption and carbon dioxide emission for Malaysia using maximum entropy bootstrap approach. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 1–13
- Hadri K (2000) Testing for stationarity in heterogeneous panel data. *Econ J* 148–161
- Hagemann M, Ndambi A, Hemme T, Latacz-Lohmann U (2012) Contribution of milk production to global greenhouse gas emissions. An estimation based on typical farms. *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int* 19:390–402. doi:10.1007/s11356-011-0571-8
- Huang B-N, Hwang MJ, Yang CW (2008) Causal relationship between energy consumption and GDP growth revisited: a dynamic panel data approach. *Ecol Econ* 67:41–54. doi:10.1016/j.ecolecon.2007.11.006
- Hussain S, Peng S, Fahad S, Khaliq A, Huang J, Cui K, Nie L (2015) Rice management interventions to mitigate greenhouse gas emissions: a review. *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int* 22:3342–3360. doi:10.1007/s11356-014-3760-4
- Im KS, Pesaran MH, Shin Y (2003) Testing for unit roots in heterogeneous panels. *J Econ* 115:53–74
- Johansen S (1995) Likelihood-based inference in cointegrated vector autoregressive models OUP catalogue
- Kankal M, Akpınar A, Kömürçü Mİ, Özşahin TŞ (2011) Modeling and forecasting of Turkey's energy consumption using socio-economic and demographic variables. *Appl Energy* 88:1927–1939. doi:10.1016/j.apenergy.2010.12.005
- Levin A, Lin C-F, Chu C-SJ (2002) Unit root tests in panel data: asymptotic and finite-sample properties. *J Econ* 108:1–24
- Li W, Ou Q, Chen Y (2014) Decomposition of China's CO₂ emissions from agriculture utilizing an improved Kaya identity. *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int* 21:13000–13006. doi:10.1007/s11356-014-3250-8
- Liu W et al (2015) Greenhouse gas emissions, soil quality, and crop productivity from a mono-rice cultivation system as influenced by fallow season straw management. *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int*
- Lozano S, Gutiérrez E (2008) Non-parametric frontier approach to modelling the relationships among population, GDP, energy consumption and CO₂ emissions. *Ecol Econ* 66:687–699. doi:10.1016/j.ecolecon.2007.11.003
- Maddala GS, Wu S (1999) A comparative study of unit root tests with panel data and a new simple test. *Oxf Bull Econ Stat* 61:631–652
- Mahadeva L, Robinson P (2004) Unit root testing to help model building Ministry of Food and Agriculture Agriculture in Ghana, Facts and Figures
- Ozturk I, Acaravci A (2011) Electricity consumption and real GDP causality nexus: evidence from ARDL bounds testing approach for 11 MENA countries. *Appl Energy* 88:2885–2892
- Pesaran MH, Shin Y (1998) An autoregressive distributed-lag modelling approach to cointegration analysis. *Econ Soc Monogr* 31:371–413
- Pesaran MH, Shin Y, Smith RJ (2001) Bounds testing approaches to the analysis of level relationships. *J Appl Econ* 16:289–326
- Roth E et al (2014) Impact of raw pig slurry and pig farming practices on physicochemical parameters and on atmospheric N₂O and CH₄ emissions of tropical soils, Uvea Island (South Pacific). *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int* 21:10022–10035. doi:10.1007/s11356-014-3048-8
- Soytas U, Sari R (2009) Energy consumption, economic growth, and carbon emissions: challenges faced by an EU candidate member. *Ecol Econ* 68:1667–1675. doi:10.1016/j.ecolecon.2007.06.014
- Tilman D, Cassman KG, Matson PA, Naylor R, Polasky S (2002) Agricultural sustainability and intensive production practices. *Nature* 418:671–677
- UNTC United Nations Treaty Collection (2015) <https://treaties.un.org/>. Accessed Nov 14
- Zhang X-P, Cheng X-M (2009) Energy consumption, carbon emissions, and economic growth in China. *Ecol Econ* 68:2706–2712. doi:10.1016/j.ecolecon.2009.05.011